Participatory Development Communication for Family Food Security during the Covid-19 Pandemic

Enggar Dwiki Egiwirantia[1] dan Nia Ashton Destrity[2]

[1]*Communication Department, Universitas Brawijaya, Malang, Indonesia*
[2] *Communication Department, Universitas Brawijaya, Malang, Indonesia*
*Corresponding author, ✉ *nia.ashton@ub.ac.id*

Abstract

The objective of this study is to elaborate and assess participatory development communication strategies employed in women's empowerment program by an Islamic non-governmental organization, specifically Lembaga Lingkungan Hidup dan Penanggulangan Bencana (LLHPB) 'Aisyiyah (Environment and Disaster Management Institute) Probolinggo City, East Java, Indonesia in 2020 to attain family food security during the Covid-19 pandemic. The three series of activities that constitute this empowerment program include training on planting vegetables, training on vegetables and fish cultivation in buckets, and engaging the online 'Aisyiyah Market group. This study utilized a case study methodology, collecting data through documentation and interviews with six informants who were committee members and members of 'Aisyiyah who are active in the empowerment initiative. This study demonstrates that, generally, the circumstance that the committee retains complete authority during crucial decision-making phases contributes to the practice of participatory communication in empowerment program. According to this study, the three activities used monologic and dialogic communication modalities in varying methods. Because collaborative member involvement only occurs when planning the formation of the 'Aisyiyah Market group, the level of member participation in the other two activities is still at a low level and only reveals involvement at the implementation and post-implementation stages of the activity.

Introduction

The severe respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) or Covid-19 has spread throughout the country, posing a threat to public health as well as to the economy and human existence. Agus Eko Nugroho, the head of the research center for economics at the Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI), claims that the Covid-19 pandemic's effect on household economic stability was presented on by a decline in income brought on by

layoffs, salary reductions, and a decline in operating profit, as well as a lack of income and space as a result of community care (LIPI, 2020). According to Probolinggo City's Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs), who complained the drop in their orders and sales until the closure of outlets, turnover fell by 50%, and the city's economic growth rate declined (Radar Bromo, 2021a, 2021b). The community's decreased ability to meet its everyday demands, including its need for food, is another effect of this state. In addition, the application of social limitations has an effect on the speed of food distribution, which affects the uneven distribution of food across all regions, resulting in both surplus and deficit production in some areas.

According to the findings of a meeting with a committee of the Environmental and Disaster Management Institute (LLHPB) 'Aisyiyah Probolinggo City, East Java, Indonesia, Muhammadiyah organization established Muhammadiyah Covid-19 Command Center in response to the negative effects of the Covid-19 pandemic (MCCC). The Regional Leader of 'Aisyiyah Probolinggo City received instructions from the Central Leadership (PP) of 'Aisyiyah and the MCCC to organize many empowerment events with the women of 'Aisyiyah members through the LLHPB program in order to strengthen the state of family food security. An Indonesian non-governmental Islamic Muhammadiyah organization called 'Aisyiyah is interested in empowering women. 'Aisyiyah is a religious social organization that does not engage in politics (Nurjanah, Mutiarin, Supangkat, & Iqbal, 2022).

The LLHPB 'Aisyiyah Probolinggo City women's empowerment initiative aims to encourage moms to work together to solve issues that arise during the Covid-19 pandemic by achieving family food security and enhancing the family economy. Horticultural plant nurseries, training on fish and vegetable cultivation in buckets, and activating the online 'Aisyiyah Market group were a few of the initiatives completed. Women from representatives of 'Aisyiyah sub-district level (Regional Leader of 'Aisyiyah Branch) Probolinggo City, instructors at 'Aisyiyah Amal Usaha, early childhood education (PAUD) and kindergarten (TK) children, as well as MSME 'Aisyiyah members, participated in the series of activities.

Building women's independence and understanding what it means to be empowered from within constitutes the process of empowering women (Shefner-Rogers, Rao, Rogers, & Wayangankar, 1998). Women's participation in the family economic development program is intended to increase their self-assurance and ability to take action to better their families' financial circumstances. The definition of self-control, according to Albrecht, derives from the conviction that one person's communication behavior can have the desired impact on others. Empowerment is essentially an interactional process (Papa, Singhal, Ghanekar, & Papa, 2000). Women's participation in the family economic development program is intended to increase their self-assurance and ability to take action to better their families' financial circumstances. The definition of self-control, according to Albrecht, depicts from the conviction that one person's communication behavior can have the desired effect on others. Albrecht perceives empowerment as essentially an interactive activity (Touri, 2016) as well as growth. A horizontal or two-way communication approach that encourages direct and active community participation is becoming more and more prevalent in communication (Mefalopulos, 2008).

To prevent being unable to meet their own food demands during difficult times, such as during the Covid-19 pandemic, empowerment programs that help families achieve food security are also deemed crucial. Community empowerment, which entails boosting community independence and capability to actively participate in achieving the availability, distribution, and occasional use of food, is the emphasis of food security development in

order to create family food security (Purwaningsih, 2008). Women who are committed to empowering themselves will think about how their actions will affect them and their families before taking any action (Papa et al., 2000). Empowered women are women who are capable of developing themselves and taking a stand in spreading their influence and guiding their group to collaborate (Lestari, Fadilah, & Wuryanta, 2020). It can be claimed that shared strength overcomes an individual's vulnerability when vulnerable women organize their surroundings in pursuit of common goals. It creates chances for collective learning, mutually supportive activities, and group action (Rogers & Singhal, 2003).

It might be signified that the interactional actions involved in bringing about the desired transformation are closely associated with the empowerment process. Additionally, social events can encourage group action in the process of empowering women. Additionally, there are a number of stages of participatory development communication programs in the empowerment program that place an emphasis on the community's or stakeholders' active participation in crucial stages for decision making connected to the goals and changes to be attained (Tufte & Mefalopulos, 2009). However, some earlier data continue to support the idea that incorporating a participatory method into development initiatives is a costly, time-consuming, and challenging process (Mhagama, 2016). This belief may emerge from the participatory strategy, which Mitchell & Gorove describe as a technique that frequently lowers political risk, improves project design and performance, increases transparency of operations, and increases community voice and participation (Mefalopulos, 2008). According to Jules Pretty, involvement in the community is frequently viewed as functional participation, which is a type of involvement frequently connected to efficiency: After significant decisions are taken by outside parties, people participate to better accomplish program objectives and cut expenses, which, in Melkote's view, violates the idea of participatory communication, which calls for engagement at all stages of the development process (Mhagama, 2016). Furthermore, Tufte & Mefalopulos (2009) have shown that individuals or stakeholders need not be involved in each stage of planning as long as they have the chance to participate in the decision-making process.

Numerous studies have been done on the role communication activities have in empowerment initiatives, particularly those that focus on women's empowerment. In the research of Shefner-Rogers et al. (1998) outlined how the Cooperative Development Program for women dairy farmers in India has helped them become more economically independent through improved milk quality and higher milk production. The process of dialogue between program implementers and participants as well as between participants, which aims to promote self-efficacy or individual confidence in their ability to achieve something, is thought to have helped women improve their economic circumstances through empowerment programs (Shefner-Rogers et al., 1998).

The Grameen Bank program in Bangladesh has also performed empowerment initiatives to boost women's economic status. According to Rogers & Singhal (2003), Grameen Bank is a microloan program designed to empower underprivileged women so they can support themselves. This loan method makes use of a small group network that brings together staff of Grameen Bank and a group of five female borrowers, enabling them to interact, socialize, exchange ideas, and decide how to respond to life's challenges (Rogers & Singhal, 2003). In the KwaZulu-Natal Province of South Africa, a different study on women's empowerment in agriculture with an emphasis on household vulnerability to food insecurity has also been conducted (Sharaunga, Mudhara, & Bogale, 2015). However, there are no studies that investigate women's empowerment programs from the perspective of participatory development communication in times of health emergencies and disasters,

in this case the Covid-19 epidemic. The role of Islamic groups in facilitating empowerment initiatives is another significant component supporting this research.

The researcher believes that the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah program tends to only partially implement participatory development communication, departing from prior study and the initial data that was successfully gathered. However, given that the program has the potential to be a sustainable empowerment program with a strategy to incorporate engaged community participation and achieve the desired change goals, this initial finding has to be followed up. For a comprehensive empowerment process to be realized, community involvement is crucial. To evaluate the level of community involvement in an empowerment program, it is also necessary to examine the level of community participation. Therefore, the purpose of this study is to evaluate the amount of community involvement in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah empowerment program, Probolinggo City, East Java, Indonesia, as well as the participatory development communication approach. The planning and execution of programs based on the Communication Program Cycle from Tufte & Mefalopulos (2009), which has several stages, encompassing participatory communication assessment (PCA), communication strategy design, implementation, and monitoring evaluation, are included in the development communication strategy in question. This method involves a communication strategy which is divided into two modes: dialogic mode and monologic/ diffusion mode (one-way communication) (two-way communication).

Methodology

This study employs a qualitative research design with a constructivist paradigm to investigate the participatory development communication strategy in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah empowerment program in Probolinggo City. The case study method is utilized in this kind of qualitative research. In order to attain family food security during the COVID-19 pandemic, LLHPB 'Aisyiyah Probolinggo City, East Java, Indonesia will be implementing a women's empowerment program in 2020. The researcher hopes to better understand this strategy by conducting this research. According to Yin, the case study approach enables researchers to preserve the comprehensive and significant elements of actual events (Sellnow, Ulmer, Seeger, & Littlefield, 2009). In Probolinggo City, East Java, Indonesia, during the Covid-19 pandemic, this women's empowerment initiative by LLHPB 'Aisyiyah demonstrates the distinctiveness of the practice of empowering family food security programs.

Six informants, encompassing administrators of the Regional Leadership of 'Aisyiyah City of Probolinggo who were involved in and responsible for the program and members of 'Aisyiyah City of Probolinggo, as the target beneficiaries and participated in the program, were interviewed in semi-structured form by the researcher. Researchers also employed archives of meeting minutes (meeting notes) pertaining to the empowerment program as documentation in addition to interviews.

This study employs an interactive model of data analysis techniques developed by Miles et al. (2014), which consists of three components: data condensation, data presentation, and drawing conclusions and verification. During the condensation stage, the researcher selects, focuses, and simplifies data based on interview transcripts, documents, and other empirical materials derived from field data mining. The researcher then organizes and presents the data based on the categories or key findings discovered. The researcher then draws conclusions based on the research findings and credible evidence.

Results and Discussion

Topical Participatory Communication Assessment in Determining the Objectives of the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah's Program

It can be implied that the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah program is a type of follow-up to the directives of the Central Leadership 'Aisyiyah if perceived through its aims. The claim made by one of the research informants, that the LLHPB program is a national initiative that aspires to restore family food security beginning with the women members of 'Aisyiyah, Probolinggo City, East Java, Indonesia, supports this as well. This demonstrates that efforts to pinpoint the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah program's primary problems are made topically since the program is administered according to an ongoing set of predetermined goals and may not be participatory (Tufte & Mefalopulos, 2009). A topical two-way communication assessment can be administered to support the achievement of the goals set for an ongoing program by helping to reduce problems and get the program back on track, even though it is important to identify issues through a two-way communication assessment from the early stages of the program (Mefalopulos, 2008). The limitations of the assessment of topical participatory communication lie in the nature and program objectives that are still considered relevant to community conditions, even though the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah program did not identify the primary issues in other sectors related to food security issues during the Covid-19 pandemic, this process can still be considered a partially participatory approach (Tufte & Mefalopulos, 2009).

Identification of Problems, Opportunities, and Solutions as the Basis for Determining the Activities of LLHPB 'Aisyiyah

The LLHPB 'Aisyiyah committee observed issues with the community, particularly the women's group, from the economic and psychological aspects of individuals in the form of fear and anxiety when perceived from the identification of problems, needs, opportunities, risks, and solutions from Tufte & Mefalopulos (2009). This subset of mothers' financial issues was brought on by a drop in household income. Additionally, there are more fundamental home requirements that must be supplied despite the constrained space for movement and communal attempts to stop the spread of the Covid-19 disease. As a result, in addition to the community's diminishing purchasing power, there are other factors that are making it difficult for people to satisfy their food needs.

The decision was made by the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah committee to perform two activities—training in vegetable seeding (planting) and training in vegetable and fish production in buckets—without first attempting to identify the unique needs of the community. Even though the context for selecting the training activities can still be identified as pertinent to the situation and state of the community as a whole, in the early phases of program initiation it should be conducted in a dialogue between development agents and stakeholders involved, both beneficiaries and outside parties. When two-way communication is employed from the outset of planning, issues and program failures can be avoided because if it is not completed from the start, development communication will become less effective (Mefalopulos, 2008).

Moreover, the third activity, which depicted the form of activating the 'Aisyiyah Market online community, initiated by 'Aisyiyah members. The LLHPB area manager 'Aisyiyah was informed by one of the members of 'Aisyiyah that an online group should be created for the 'Aisyiyah Market. The committee then performed the plan by establishing 'Aisyiyah Market, an online marketplace. The Covid-19 pandemic caused 'Aisyiyah MSME actors' income to fall, which led to the creation of the online market group. This activity was initiated as a result of member input, which the committee then followed up on,

rather than the committee collecting information from the 'Aisyiyah members. Members' own initiatives demonstrate how to organize activities through dialogical communication by examining their circumstances and needs without committee interference (Tufte & Mefalopulos, 2009).

Establishment of a Dialogue Room in the Planning of the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah Program

The goal of participatory communication is to promote two-way communication among the various participants in the empowerment program. A horizontal or two-way communication strategy that encourages direct and active community participation is the foundation of participatory development communication (Mefalopulos, 2008). Therefore, a development or empowerment program has to create a venue that allows for meetings amongst the various program participants. The findings of informant interviews revealed that there were discrepancies in the utilization of dialogue space during the activity planning process between the three LLHPB 'Aisyiyah activities in East Java.

Interactions between the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah committee were developed during the activity formulation process for the training activities for vegetable nurseries and training on vegetable and fish cultivation in buckets. The committee and the Department of Agriculture, Food Security, and Fisheries then had exchanges through meetings. The Association of Farmers' Groups and the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah committee also worked together to support needs throughout the activity, specifically the need for useful companions and vegetable seeds. It demonstrates that the committee's planning of activities with the Department of Agriculture, Food Security, and Fisheries and Farmers' Groups as partners in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah program involved a dialogical approach.

The committee included members of 'Aisyiyah during the socialization of the LLHPB program to establish a preliminary understanding between the program committee and the beneficiaries before the implementation of the vegetable nursery training and training on vegetable and fish cultivation in buckets. It indicates that when the activity idea and activity plan have been developed, the committee includes members as beneficiaries. As a monologic or diffusion mode of communication with a predetermined objective, socialization is admitted to flow linearly (Tufte & Mefalopulos, 2009). Mefalopulos emphasized that attention should also be made on developing a sustained dialogue that would allow trust building, share knowledge and experiences, and lead to more solutions and empowerment for the developing community. In contrast, communication techniques in a participatory paradigm should not be restricted to the use of media and broadcast of messages (Touri, 2016). Consider the socialization instance in this program, according to The World Bank, this participation activity is part of the information sharing process, which simply attempts to exchange information about what will be conducted through one-way communication (Mefalopulos, 2008).

One LLHPB 'Aisyiyah effort, the creation of the 'Aisyiyah Market, revealed various discoveries. The 'Aisyiyah market is a project started by the 'Aisyiyah members (beneficiaries), who spoke with the LLHPB area manager in 'Aisyiyah Probolinggo City. Because development is viewed in the participatory paradigm as a dialectical and multidimensional process, initiatives that originate from beneficiaries are a process of planning activities through dialogical communication modes and are more participatory because social interaction cannot be separated from an individual's ability to make decisions to maintain their welfare (Touri, 2016). Informal communication has been established between members of 'Aisyiyah and the LLHPB committee of 'Aisyiyah Probolinggo City. It means that conversation during informal gatherings like this one does become a comfortable zone for participants. A discussion space can take many different shapes, but

it must be a welcoming place where stakeholders can voice their opinions, complain, and offer suggestions for the improvements they desire (Tufte & Mefalopulos, 2009).

Expected Level of Change in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah Program

The research informant revealed that there was socialization geared toward 'Aisyiyah members at the start of the training for vegetable nurseries and training for vegetable and fish production in buckets. The program's goals are communicated through this socialization, which also increases members' awareness of and interest in the trainings offered. It is intended that by the time they reach their individual homes, the members of 'Aisyiyah will have learned how to independently meet their own dietary needs. The desired change through the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah program is included in the monologic mode, which entails developing consciousness, knowledge, and conduct, as viewed from the level of change described by Tufte & Mefalopulos (2009). According to Mefalopulos (2008), these types of change need to take place in a particular order; first, awareness must be raised through communication, followed by understanding of relevant issues, and last, a change in the desired particular attitude and behavior.

Instead of training exercises, the interactive or dialogical process between 'Aisyiyah members and the committee could be witnessed when members discussed their original idea for establishing an online market group. Reactivating the activities of 'Aisyiyah MSME members, which were reduced during the Covid-19 epidemic, is the desired change that will result from the creation of the 'Aisyiyah Market group. Changes resulting from a dialogical process typically result in changes at the level of coalition building, mobilization, mediation, and conflict resolution (Tufte & Mefalopulos, 2009). The goal of change through dialogical mode is not predetermined from the start, and the ultimate result is undefined, i.e., it involves exploring issues and producing new knowledge or solutions rather than merely disseminating information (Tufte & Mefalopulos, 2009). The 'Aisyiyah Market Group" is a platform and system created so that 'Aisyiyah members can engage in business operations to better their economic circumstances. The 'Aisyiyah Market group's initiatives are not short-term, measurable projects; instead, they call for long-term, sustainable activities with the potential to continuously adapt, assess, and create new innovations. As attempting to solve the problems of 'Aisyiyah members center on the community's own initiatives and potentials, the desired change from MSME activities in the 'Aisyiyah Market group can be evaluated as a change in the level of community mobilization (Primahendra, 2016).

Education and Training, IEC, and Community Mobilization as a Communication Approach in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah Program

Through the training exercises offered, the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah committee hopes that members will become aware of and interested in meeting their own dietary needs. Community gatherings with extension workers are activities that help increase awareness. According to Tufte & Mefalopulos (2009), the committee invited members of 'Aisyiyah to socialization and training events, as perceived in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah program. Probolinggo City's LLHPB area manager, extension personnel from the city's agriculture, food security, and fisheries service, and representatives of the Association of Farmers' Groups were also present to help participants. Furthermore, Members of 'Aisyiyah will obtain information and skills from this training session about how to independently create food ingredients. One of the communication strategies used in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah program is education and training. Approaches like education and training frequently take place at the interpersonal level, typically rely on interactive communication models, and involve instructional design (Mefalopulos, 2008). Members can support their ability to empower themselves by providing resources and training in breeding and growing.

The committee urges representatives of the members present to provide training materials to other members within their respective institutions in order to apply the health protocol by restricting the number of beneficiaries present. The LLHPB 'Aisyiyah committee's strategy can be perceived as a way to spread knowledge to a larger audience. According to Mefalopulos (2008), the information, education, and communication (IEC) approach, which aims to disseminate knowledge and educate a large audience using a variety of media options, can be employed as one communication approach in the empowering process. The objective of IEC in empowerment initiatives, according to Sandjaja in Kartika (2015), is to inform, persuade, educate, and alter people's behavior.

Other activities classify the initiative and production capacity of 'Aisyiyah members, which is what led to the creation of the 'Aisyiyah Market group, as an empowerment process using a community mobilization strategy because efforts to address the issue place an emphasis on the initiative and capacity of the community itself (Primahendra, 2016). Community mobilization is a strategy that actively engages the community in addressing issues pertaining to their welfare (Mefalopulos, 2008). After the group is established, the committee helps create a pre-order purchasing and selling transaction mechanism that MSME actors and their potential clients can utilize. The MSME operations of 'Aisyiyah, which switched from offline to online sales, are a practice of mobilization via bolstering already-existing groups, structures, and procedures that successfully serve the community (Primahendra, 2016). The process of empowering 'Aisyiyah members as independent business players has direct control over their lives and environment through the group and the buying and selling transaction system that has been established (Servaes, 2020)one considers communication to be crucial to effectively tackle the major problems of today. Hence, the question being addressed in this handbook is, is there a right communication strategy? Perspectives on sustainability, participation, and culture in communication have changed over time in line with the evolution of development approaches and trends, and in response to the need for effective applications of communication methods and tools to new issues and priorities. Divided into prominent themes comprising relevant chapters written by experts in the field and reviewed by renowned editors, the book addresses topics where communication and social change converge in both theory and praxis. Specific concerns and issues include food security, climate change, poverty reduction, health, equity and gender, sustainable development goals, and information and communication technologies (ICTs.

Additionally, a tactic to increase consumer reach was the inclusion of group members from other 'Aisyiyah sympathizers in Probolinggo City. The chairman of „Aisyiyah Probolinggo City" also urged its members to conduct their shopping through the organization. It could be a way for members to support one another in an effort to help the members of 'Aisyiyah's financial situation. According to Rogers & Singhal (2003), there is a chance for collective learning, support, and group action to emerge when vulnerable individuals organize around them to achieve common goals. Support between members becomes a collective action that results in the empowerment process to achieve the desired change together. Rogers & Singhal (2003) adds that a person's vulnerability will be met with universal strengths.

Mediated and Non-Mediated Communication as Communication Channels in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah Program

The results of the study demonstrate that there are two types of communication channels utilized in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah program: mediated communication and non-mediated communication. The LLHPB 'Aisyiyah Program employs WhatsApp and Zoom as web-based communication tools to host virtual meetings, communicate with participants

individually and in groups, and monitor market activity. In the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah program, non-mediated communication is used for program socialization, interactive communication that supports education and training methods, and monitoring through personal visits.

Women who are 'Aisyiyah members may find it comfortable to communicate with one another in order to share knowledge, experiences, and anecdotes about the training process. It is evident from the findings of interviews with a number of research informants who spoke about how discussions and involvement of 'Aisyiyah mothers in vegetable planting and fish farming activities were facilitated and encouraged through WhatsApp group conversations within their respective institutions, for example in the 'Aisyiyah environment at the sub-district level. In accordance with Rogers & Singhal's (2003) assertion, people get the confidence to make the needed adjustments through talks with other people, particularly their peers. Additionally, informal interpersonal communication helps 'Aisyiyah members feel more confident while voting or expressing their thoughts.

It may be possible to influence the participation of women members of 'Aisyiyah in the implementation of activities by having extension workers from the Department of Agriculture, Food Security and Fisheries of Probolinggo City and the Association of Farmers' Groups present as well as support from the Office of Social Affairs for Women's Empowerment and Child Protection in the Probolinggo City. It is due to the fact that individuals with influence or credibility within the society might act as efficient communication channels (Mefalopulos, 2008).

Islamic Values in Communication Messages in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah Program

According to research informants, LLHPB 'Aisyiyah packaged the message of development and empowerment programs for program recipients using Islamic ideals. The significance of the Qur'anic passage that states that both men and women's acts will be valuable in Allah's eyes was used to illustrate the notion that women need to play a part in enhancing family food security during the Covid-19 outbreak. Moreover, the informant claimed that Allah bestows abilities on mankind; therefore, this skill must be applied to the community since Allah will demand responsibility for the blessings bestowed.

Members of 'Aisyiyah also consistently uphold the idea of *"khoirunnas anfauhum linnas,"* or being a human being who benefits other people. The source further expresses the expectation that the 'Aisyiyah program will benefit all aspects of peoples' life, particularly Probolinggo City residents' access to food security in the areas of education and health. The ultimate aim and hope of 'Aisyiyah shows that women are capable of becoming valuable members of society.

It was discovered through the results of interviews with the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah committee that the motivational messages supplied to the beneficiaries and the committee in charge of the LLHPB program were based on Islamic teachings. Every 'Aisyiyah activity recently incorporates a message from the committee about the importance of worship. Additionally, they convey a lesson from the Qur'an to always be a helpful person. One of the themes, according to the source, was that planting efforts were a sort of worship. In addition, the informant claimed that the motivational message was delivered by reminding him of the function of people on earth in accordance with Islamic teachings on morality.

LLHPB 'Aisyiyah organizational values or principles, which are accepted and held in high regard by both the management and members of 'Aisyiyah as beneficiaries, are used to utilize the messages intended to inspire beneficiaries to fulfill the aims of this development program. Dagron (2001) states that the communication process is tailored to each unique community or social group in terms of both content, language, culture, and

media. It means that different social and cultural contexts of society do not always call for the use of the same techniques, media, and messages.

The committee's message was provided to 'Aisyiyah members as encouragement and a reminder to participate in a number of activities with LLHPB 'Aisyiyah. Mefalopulos & Kamlongera (2004) categorized these messages into presentation types for motivating and demanding messages based on the message being conveyed. Presentation of command messages is typically used as a reminder to perform specific activities, whereas presentation of motivational messages itself employs a combination of emotional and rational appeals to persuade and promote action among interaction groups.

The purpose of the message sent to members by the LLHPB committee 'Aisyiyah was to reinforce the importance of women's participation in improving family circumstances in the area of food security. The informant explained to the female members of 'Aisyiyah that caring for the family's health can be done by a woman, wife, or mother through vegetable growing. Because the messages are targeted at functional or practical requirements or wants connected to the issues discussed, such as durability, other people's protection, security, or safety, both messages contain rational arguments (Mefalopulos & Kamlongera, 2004).

Additionally, speakers from the program committee shared religious messages on the contribution that women may make to doing good on earth, religiously inspired activities, and the advantages that people have for other people. The committee's teachings possessed an element of emotional appeal since they sought to influence people's behavior by appealing to their feeling of humanity and sense of loyalty to God. The psychological, sociological, and symbolic needs and goals of the community are targeted by messages that have an emotional appeal, such as loyalty to others, empathy for others, feelings, and representations of human connection to Allah through worship (Mefalopulos & Kamlongera, 2004).

The Implementation Stage in the Communication Program Cycle in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah Program

The identification and creation of strategies that were discussed in the preceding sub-chapter are employed to guide the program's operation during the implementation phase. Program implementation, according to Mefalopulos (2008), entails the goals that have been generated, the audience that is being served, the activities that are performed, the sources of funding and human resources required to support the program, the responsible parties, and the timeframe for the program. An action plan is typically employed to perform the implementation stage and can be utilized to illustrate what has to be completed, by whom, when, and how much money is required (Mefalopulos, 2008). To ensure that the development program is performed as planned, an action plan is formulated. Prior to the implementation of each activity in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah program, a committee meeting with the Regional Leadership 'Aisyiyah Chairperson is organized to discuss the activity plan. The committee employs the minutes from meetings and after-action reports as recommendations for implementing the program. A follow-up plan that serves as the framework for executing additional activities is incorporated in the minutes of this activity.

Formative and Summative Evaluation on LLHPB 'Aisyiyah Program

According to Mefalopulos (2008), summative evaluation, also understood as program evaluation, is an effort to gauge the overall effectiveness of communication activities within a program. Formative evaluation, also recognized as monitoring, is an activity to assess the progress of activities, ensuring that the design and implementation of activities are still running in accordance with the goals and plans. Understanding the program's end results

requires monitoring the progress of the program's operations (Tufte & Mefalopulos, 2009). The informant claimed that the monitoring activity sparked conversations amongst a number of 'Aisyiyah members at the sub-district level regarding concerns to continuing activities, which were later interpreted as a sign that the activities were incompatible with the interests of the community. The informant added that the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah committee took into account the activity report from lower-level management when instructing members to engage in specific tasks or find substitutes for them. The objective of the evaluation is crucial to track the activity process and take the best possible action, as demonstrated by Mefalopulos (2008).

The outcomes of assessing the long-term viability of the activities performed by 'Aisyiyah members serve as assessment data for the committee's program follow-up operations. The informant claims that future training activities must be distinct from earlier training activities based on monitoring findings that reveal members' failure to continue activities. To learn from past failures and improve future endeavors, program evaluation is crucial to conduct (Mefalopulos, 2008).

Even though the monitoring process was interactive and produced considerations for the committee in deciding on alternative steps given to 'Aisyiyah members, the results of the informant's explanation also presented that the program evaluation meeting was only performed by the committee without involving members of the 'Aisyiyah. As a result, the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah evaluation committee operated in a monologuized, or running in a single direction, communication method. In fact, a participatory empowerment program requires mutual agreement from all stakeholders in deciding what and how to assess a change through satisfaction assessments and opinions from program recipients at the local level (Tufte & Mefalopulos, 2009) or in this research refer to the judgments and opinions of members of 'Aisyiyah.

The Level of Participation of 'Aisyiyah Members in the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah Program

If the community is not involved in the decision-making process when deciding the scope of change and the objectives to achieve it, there will not be any meaningful participation (Tufte & Mefalopulos, 2009). There is no requirement for community involvement at any point of the program as long as the community is included at the decision-making stage (Tufte & Mefalopulos, 2009). Members of the 'Aisyiyah were excluded from the activity planning process for the two training exercises—planting plants and raising fish and vegetables in buckets—both in terms of giving input and making decisions. This is evident from the findings of interviews with research informants, who argued that the idea for the fish and vegetable cultivation training in buckets came from the program committee and that the training activity for planting vegetables was a development of already-existing activities in the organization. Further participation by 'Aisyiyah members occurred both during and after the activities. The members' participation in the two training exercises demonstrated that only the committee of the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah performed the planning and decision-making processes, which were then disseminated to the 'Aisyiyah members. According to Van de Fliert (2010), the type of involvement in these two activities results in the customary level of participation, which is participation in which the program committee makes the final decision with little input from the beneficiaries.

Members of the 'Aisyiyah took part in the planning of activities when the online market group for the 'Aisyiyah was established. Members of 'Aisyiyah and the area manager of LLHPB 'Aisyiyah Probolinggo City engage in conversation or interpersonal communication as part of this program. The initiative or input from the members of 'Aisyiyah became a consideration for the committee to materialize and develop the market group through the

creation of this market group. In accordance with what Van de Fliert (2010) said about the degree of collaborative participation, the involvement of 'Aisyiyah members as the activity's initiator implies that decisions are made based on the outcomes of two-way communication between the committee and members of 'Aisyiyah after taking into account the opinions and suggestions of both parties. At this degree of cooperative involvement, community feedback in the discussion between these two pertinent stakeholders can be valued or taken into consideration, particularly with reference to community-based development programs (Mefalopulos, 2008).

Conclusion

In order to maintain family food security during the Covid-19 pandemic, LLHPB 'Aisyiyah in Probolinggo City, East Java, has created a women's empowerment program. Due to the Central LLHPB's determination of the program's objectives, it is possible to infer from the data collected that participatory communication happens in part as a result (topical). Two training activities for LLHPB 'Aisyiyah were proposed and decided upon by the committee (facilitator) using a monolog communication mode, whereas the concept for creating an online 'Aisyiyah Market group was developed through an interactive (dialogical) process between the committee and members serving as beneficiaries.

Two training activities in this program's communication strategy design stage use education and training strategies in addition to information, education, and communication to modify people's levels of awareness, knowledge, and behavior (IEC). When the 'Aisyiyah online market group is created, it uses a community mobilization strategy to bring about changes at the level of mobilization through the creation of processes, systems, and groups within it. Prior to the start of the events, the committee (facilitator) and members engage in program socialization to increase knowledge (beneficiaries). Communication channels employed in the program include mediated communication via communication technologies like Zoom, WhatsApp chat and groups, as well as non-mediated communication via actual meetings, interpersonal communication, and opinion leaders. The message is delivered through inspirational quotes, reminders, and rational and emotive appeals based on Islamic principles as the foundation of the organization 'Aisyiyah, which also serves as the sociocultural backdrop for the committee's and the beneficiary members' daily lives.

The LLHPB 'Aisyiyah program is implemented by the committee in accordance with the initial plans through a committee meeting with the necessary governmental organizations and farmer groups. The relevant government agencies provide the necessary training materials, and farmer organizations provide hands-on support. Following the exercise, members distributed materials to other members in order to foster communication among them and collective learning, which in turn encouraged other members to participate in performing similar activities. The committee creates activity minutes comprising follow-up plans as a roadmap (action plan) for completing the next activity after reporting on the implementation of the previous activities.

The monitoring and assessment stage is implemented through direct house visits and interpersonal communication utilizing WhatsApp chat and groups. Even though the planning process was initially monologic, monitoring activities were dialogical, which resulted in input from the beneficiaries in the form of challenges and prompted the committee to make decisions as a next step. The results of the monitoring are also employed by the LLHPB 'Aisyiyah committee to plan future operations as assessment data. This demonstrates that, through one-way (monological) communication, the committee continues to exert the majority of power over the decision-making process at the evaluation

stage and excludes 'Aisyiyah members (beneficiaries) from the exploration of novel concepts.

As a result of the level of participation, it is implied that the members' involvement as program beneficiaries is still minimal because they have limited influence over the crucial decision-making processes. Only when creating the online 'Aisyiyah Market group did members of the group participate in decision-making through informal (dialogical) interpersonal communication with the committee; in contrast, during the two training exercises, members of the group either participated at a conventional level or in the form of information sharing. Members of 'Aisyiyah are more actively involved in functional participation, particularly during implementation and following activities.

The researcher suggests that additional study be conducted to analyze communication channels, including interpersonal and mediated channels. Mediated channels include the use of communication technologies in empowerment and development initiatives. Additionally, there is need for additional investigation of messages of empowerment and development based on principles that are compatible with the sociocultural context of the local people, who are the intended beneficiaries. Another intriguing area for further study is the function of opinion leaders in raising beneficiary participation and involvement in local communities. This research's issue, the communication network between participants in Islamic organizations' empowerment and development initiatives, is extremely likely to be examined.

The LLHPB 'Aisyiyah organization in Probolinggo City, East Java, can utilize the evaluation data from this research to construct development initiatives that will enable beneficiaries to participate to a greater extent. Additionally, other program facilitators for development and empowerment can learn about and obtain insight into the planning and execution of development and empowerment programs. Through two-way (dialogical) communication, both formal and informal, the Regional Leadership of LLHPB 'Aisyiyah can also increase the involvement and participation of members or representatives of 'Aisyiyah members at the planning, decision-making, and evaluation stages. It will allow the programs initiated and implemented to be in accordance with the interests and needs of the community.

References

Dagron, A. G. (2001). Making Waves: Participatory Communication for Social Change. In *The Rockefeller Foundation*. New York: The Rockefeller Foundation. https://doi.org/10.4337/9781789906356.00015

Kartika, R. (2015). Strategi komunikasi informasi edukasi gerakan kesetaraan dan keadilan jender di kementerian pemberdayaan perempuan. *Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi*, *3*(1), 8.

Lestari, N., Fadilah, A. N., & Wuryanta, E. W. (2020). Empowered Women & Social Media: Analyzing #YourBeautyRules in Cyberfeminism Perspective. *Jurnal ASPIKOM*, *5*(2),

280. https://doi.org/10.24329/aspikom.v5i2.664

LIPI, L. (2020). Survei Dampak Pandemi COVID-19 terhadap Ekonomi Rumah Tangga Indonesia | Lembaga Ilmu Pengetahuan Indonesia. Retrieved June 27, 2022, from http://lipi.go.id/siaranpress/survei-dampak-pandemi-covid-19-terhadap-ekonomi-rumah-tangga-indonesia/22123

Mefalopulos, P. (2008). Development Communication Sourcebook: Broadening the Boundaries of Communication. In *Development Communication Sourcebook*. Washington, D.C.: The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/The World Bank. https://doi.org/10.1596/978-0-8213-7522-8

Mefalopulos, P., & Kamlongera, C. (2004). *Participatory Communication Strategy Design. A Handbook* (Second Edi). Rome. Retrieved from ftp://ftp.fao.org/docrep/fao/008/y5794e/y5794e00.pdf%5Cnhttp://www.fao.org/index_en.htm

Mhagama, P. (2016). The importance of participation in development through community radio: A case study of Nkhotakota community radio station in Malawi. *Critical Arts*, *30*(1), 45–61. https://doi.org/10.1080/02560046.2016.1164384

Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.). Los Angeles, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc.

Nurjanah, A., Mutiarin, D., Supangkat, G., & Iqbal, M. (2022). Aisyiyah Organizational Communication in Realizing the True Islamic Society. *Jurnal ASPIKOM*, *7*(1), 142. https://doi.org/10.24329/aspikom.v7i1.895

Papa, M. J., Singhal, A., Ghanekar, D. V., & Papa, W. H. (2000). Organizing for Social Change Through Cooperative Action: The (Dis)Empowering Dimensions of Women's Communication. *Communication Theory*, *10*(1), 90–123. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2885.2000.tb00181.x

Primahendra, R. (2016). *Mobilisasi Sosial sebagai Mekanisme Mengatasi Kemiskinan*. Jakarta.

Purwaningsih, Y. (2008). Ketahanan Pangan: Situasi, Permasalahan, Kebijakan, Dan Pemberdayaan Masyarakat. *Jurnal Ekonomi Pembangunan: Kajian Masalah Ekonomi Dan Pembangunan*, *9*(1), 1. https://doi.org/10.23917/jep.v9i1.1028

Radar Bromo, R. B. (2021a). Dampak Pandemi, Omzet UMKM Turun 50 Persen. Retrieved June 27, 2022, from Radar Bromo website: https://radarbromo.jawapos.com/probolinggo/04/07/2021/dampak-pandemi-omzet-umkm-turun-50-persen/

Radar Bromo, R. B. (2021b). Terimbas Pandemi, Laju Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Kota Probolinggo Menurun. Retrieved June 27, 2022, from Radar Bromo website: https://radarbromo.jawapos.com/probolinggo/12/04/2021/terimbas-pandemi-laju-pertumbuhan-ekonomi-kota-probolinggo-menurun/

Rogers, E. M., & Singhal, A. (2003). Chapter 3: Empowerment and Communication: Lessons Learned From Organizing for Social Change. *Communication Yearbook*, *27*(1), 67–85. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15567419cy2701_3

Sellnow, T. L., Ulmer, R. R., Seeger, M. W., & Littlefield, R. S. (2009). Effective Risk Communication. *Effective Risk Communication*, 53–63. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-0-387-79727-4

Servaes, J. (2020). Terms and definitions in communication for development and social change. In J. Servaes (Ed.), *Handbook of communication for development and social change* (pp. 3–13). Singapore: Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-15-2014-3

Sharaunga, S., Mudhara, M., & Bogale, A. (2015). The impact of "women's empowerment

in agriculture" on household vulnerability to food insecurity in the KwaZulu-Natal province. *Forum for Development Studies*, *42*(2), 195–223. https://doi.org/10.1080/08039410.2014.997792

Shefner-Rogers, C. L., Rao, N., Rogers, E. M., & Wayangankar, A. (1998). The empowerment of women dairy farmers in India. *Journal of Applied Communication Research*, *26*(3), 319–337. https://doi.org/10.1080/00909889809365510

Touri, M. (2016). Development communication in alternative food networks: empowering Indian farmers through global market relations. *Journal of International Communication*, *22*(2), 209–228. https://doi.org/10.1080/13216597.2016.1175366

Tufte, T., & Mefalopulos, P. (2009). *Participatory Communication: A Practical Guide*. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.

Van de Fliert, E. (2010). Participatory communication in rural development: What does it take for the established order? *Extension Farming Systems Journal*, *6*(1), 95–99.