

The *Bisnis Indonesia* Newspaper Gets Revenue Stream in Convergence

Irsad*, Suyanto, Yasir

Communication Sciences Department, Universitas Riau, HR. Soebrantas No. KM. 12.5
Street, Pekanbaru, Riau, Indonesia

Corresponding author, e-mail: irsad.sati@gmail.com

Abstract

*Convergence as a model of newspaper mediamorphosis has been carried out since 1995 or a year after the internet entered Indonesia. *Bisnis Indonesia* started its convergence by launching *Bisnis.com* in 2006. This study aims to find out the dynamics faced by *Bisnis Indonesia* in maintaining the firewall, which is the ethics of journalism in commercialization. This is related to media convergence that tends to strengthen the capitalist character of the media. The research method was carried out with a qualitative approach, where the data collection technique was triangulation. The researchers interviewed ten informants from the management and two from customers using the purposive sampling technique. Internal informants range from the president director, editor-in-chief, and reporters. This study finds that convergence can be a solution for *Bisnis Indonesia* to get out of circulation problems and find revenue to continue their media business. However, it becomes a challenge to maintain the independence of the newsroom.*

Keywords: *Convergence; *Bisnis Indonesia* Daily; Revenue Stream; Firewall; Marketing Relations*

Abstrak

*Konvergensi sebagai model dari mediamorfosis dilakukan sejak 1995 atau setahun setelah Internet masuk ke Indonesia. Harian *Bisnis Indonesia* memulai konvergensi dengan meluncurkan *Bisnis.com* pada 2006. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui dinamika yang dihadapi *Bisnis Indonesia* dalam menjaga dinding api yang jadi etika jurnalisme dalam komersialisasi. Hal ini berkaitan dengan konvergensi media yang cenderung menguatkan watak kapitalis media. Metode penelitian dilakukan dengan pendekatan kualitatif dan teknik pengumpulan data secara triangulasi. Peneliti mewawancarai 10 orang informan di internal manajemen dan 2 informan dari pelanggan dengan teknik purposive sampling. Informan internal mulai dari presiden direktur, direktur pemasaran, pemimpin redaksi, wakil pemimpin redaksi, redpel, redaktur, hingga reporter. Penelitian ini menemukan bahwa konvergensi mampu menjadi solusi bagi *Bisnis Indonesia* untuk keluar dari masalah oplah, serta menemukan revenue stream untuk melanjutkan bisnis medianya. Namun hal itu menjadi tantangan untuk menjaga independensi ruang redaksinya.*

Kata Kunci: *Konvergensi; Harian *Bisnis Indonesia*; Revenue Stream; Firewall; Marketing Relations*

Introduction

The convergence of daily *Bisnis Indonesia* started from its mediamorphosis to digital pages with the release of *Bisnis.co.id* on 2 September 1996, or two years after the internet entered Indonesia. *Bisnis Indonesia* became one of the first-generation media to carry out newspaper mediamorphosis in Indonesia after *Republika* launched *Republika Online* on 17 August 1995, *Kompas Online* or *KOL* on 14 September 1995, *Tempointeraktif.com* on 6 March 1996. *Detik.com* appeared on 9 July 1998, developed by some former *DeTik* tabloid journalists whose media was banned by the New Order government in 1994 (Chano & Paramita, 2019). Mediamorphosis is a process of transitioning old media to new media, where the new media does not spontaneously appear and does not stand alone. It emerges gradually from the metamorphosis of the old media. In the process of mediamorphosis, the old media from which it originates tend to adapt and continue to develop rather than perish (Fidler, 1997).

The impact of the presence of the Internet and Network Computing as the core of the digital era has changed readers' behavior to become accustomed to seeking information through virtual news. This has become a problem for printed newspapers. Therefore, the internet is the reason for the mediamorphosis of newspapers into a form of media convergence. Convergence is a form of integration of content production processes and integration of media products that take place on digital and computing pages. Jenkins (2016) explained that media convergence is a model for the flow of content across various media platforms, the collaboration of several media industries, and the migration behavior of media audiences. Convergence is a form of integration of various media housed in digital pages in the form of a combination of text, graphics, visuals, and audio, so it is also synonymous with multimedia products (Kanyeki, 2017). In the era of convergence, paper-printed media can turn into electronic media for efficiency and lower costs (Pavlik & McIntosh, 2004). Because of that, media owners can accept convergence as a model for developing their media (McPhillips & Merlo, 2008).

In convergence, the internet provides opportunities for newspapers to gain access to readers and advertisers more broadly in the global region due to the benefits of the internet, which provides unlimited open access throughout the world, known as the global village (Marshall, 1962). *Bisnis Indonesia*, worrying about the impact of digitalization and the internet, confirmed its determination to carry out convergence which began with moving the domain address of its news site from *Bisnis.co.id* to *Bisnis.com* in 2006. Arif Budisusilo, former Chief Editor of *Bisnis Indonesia*, one of the actors, stated that *Bisnis Indonesia* must converge because it feels threatened by the presence of the internet. *Bisnis Indonesia* then developed a digital editorial in 2007 under the *Bisnis Indonesia's* News Network (JBBI), which became the forerunner of the integrated editorial kitchen created in 2012 under the name of *Bisnis Indonesia's* Information Network (JIBI) (Spyridou and Veglis, 2016). From the aspect of media products, *Bisnis Indonesia* developed the *Bisnis.com* website as a connecting site for all online and electronic media products. Mediamorphosis into a converged media is expected by the management of *Bisnis Indonesia* to save the media in terms of sustainability as a journalistic product and a media business entity.

Relevant to this research, there is a study on "The Transformation of *Kompas Daily* into a Digital News Portal Subscription, *Kompas.id*" which examines the strategy of *Kompas* in maintaining its existence in the midst of the advancement of digital media and the decline in newspaper circulation (Haq & Fadilah, 2018). There is also research

entitled “Media Convergence and Mediamorphosis: Evaluation of Print Media Digitization Strategy in Tempo Magazine” which explores the emergence of new media from Tempo Magazine (Hana & Iswahyuningtyas, 2017). The third study examines “The Dynamics of Resistance of Mass Media Against Google” which discusses the mass media feeling threatened and harmed by Google’s business (Wicaksono et al.2021). These three studies discuss this research, which concerns the development of old media into new media. Research on Tempo and Kompas magazines discusses the efforts of the two-mass media to maintain their existence as journalistic products. Meanwhile, the third study examines the efforts of national online media to fight the extortion phenomenon by content aggregator sites on the potential for advertising revenue in online media in the country as it also happens in other countries. The researchers discussed the convergence of *Bisnis Indonesia* by emphasizing the finding on revenue streams, increasing readability, and maintaining the number of circulations to maintain the viability of the media.

Method

This research on the daily convergence of *Bisnis Indonesia* was conducted using a qualitative descriptive approach, where the phenomenon of the media is a natural object (Sugiyono, 2020). Qualitative research uses open interviews to examine and understand the attitudes, views, feelings, and behaviors of individuals or groups of people (Moleong, 2018). The author conducted field research during the period August to December 2021 by interviewing ten management of *Bisnis Indonesia* and two subscribers. During the interview conducted one by one at the media center office, the authors also conducted participant observation and documentation of secondary data. The descriptive qualitative approach in this study aims to describe, explain, and answer in detail about the convergence process in *Bisnis Indonesia*. In this study, the editors of the editorial management and marketing of *Bisnis Indonesia* became a research instrument with the results reported in the form of a written script describing the situation that occurred in *Bisnis Indonesia*.

Table 1. Profile of Research Informants

No	Name of Informant	Position
1	Lulu Terianto	President Director
2	Maria Y. Benjamin	Chief Editor
3	Hery Trianto	Marketing Director
4	Arif Budisusilo	Ex Pemred/President of Solo Pos
5	Rahayuningsih	Wapemred
6	Fahmi Achmad	Wapemred
7	Surya M. Saputra	Managing Editor
8	M. Rezha Adrian	GM Intagrated Marketing
9	Khairul Anwar	Editor
10	Dwi Nicken	Reporter
11	Rizki Atriansyah	Customer/ Public Relations Manager PTPN5
12	Deddy Hasibuan	Customer/ Public Relations Manager of CIMB Niaga

Source: Research Result Data

The interviews with 12 informants obtained views, information, and data needed to see the dynamics in the media convergence process in *Bisnis Indonesia*. This is complemented by the results of observations and the acquisition of secondary data in

the field in documents and books related to the convergence.

Results and Discussion

Bisnis Indonesia Convergence amidst Decline in Circulation and Ad Revenue

The mediamorphosis of Bisnis Indonesia was carried out not because of the declining circulation and advertising revenue when launching the Bisnis.co.id website in 1996. It was factually a response to the new media that emerged in America and Europe after the emergence of the world's first online media owned by San Jose Mercury News. This California-based morning daily launched the Mercurynews.com website in March 1993 (Shapiro, 2011). The development of online media in Indonesia from its inception until the early 2000s has not become a threat to printed newspapers because Internet penetration was still low at that time, both wired Internet and Wifi and mobile Internet with mobile phones. The growth in online media audiences is largely determined by the number of internet users. The number of new internet subscribers reached 500,000 connections in 1998. Until 2006, there were only 20 million internet users compared to Indonesia's population, which reached 196.9 million at that time.

New internet penetration jumped sharply after the emergence of smartphones with the Android operating system in 2008. Research by Nielsen Company Indonesia noted that the number of smartphone users in 2008 reached 37 million and continued to rise to 54 million in 2015. In fact, a social media platform company from Canada, Hootsuite, noted that the number of smartphone users in Indonesia as of January 2020 had reached 338.2 million numbers or 124% of the total population of Indonesia, which was recorded at only 272.1 million. The growth in internet users encouraged audiences to become more interactive and participatory in seeking information, which is a hallmark of a converged culture. The term participatory culture contrasts the old notion of passive media viewing. Instead of discussing media producers and consumers occupying separate roles, we may now see them as participants interacting with each other according to a new set of rules that we do not fully understand. Not all participants are created equal. Corporations—and even individuals in the corporate media—still exert more power than any individual consumer or even aggregate consumer (Jenkins, 2006).

“The increasing number of online media audiences has started to suppress the number of printed Bisnis Indonesia subscribers, from an average of 85,000 copies to 28,000 copies. This encourages management to seriously enter into digital media,” (Results of Hery Trianto's interview at Wisma Bisnis Indonesia on 21 September 2021).

Three goals are to be achieved: increasing the readability and number of newspaper readers, increasing circulation through digital and electronic newspapers, and increasing advertising revenue through digital media. Digital media is a strategy for Bisnis Indonesia to become a long-term solution to get out of the threat of death.

“Bisnis Indonesia has started building Bisnis.com in 2006, marking the start of the digital era. However, we have not focused on the Bisnis.com yet. The pattern of work has not led to that. Everything still leads to print newspapers. It started to get serious when the newspaper industry began to decline. Everywhere, there were closures of several media in Indonesia. Like it or not, Bisnis Indonesiaes have to adapt. Now, the digital era is changing our work patterns gradually and systematically.” (Results of Rahayuningsih's interview at Wisma Bisnis Indonesia, Jakarta on Thursday, 30 September 2021).

When Bisnis Indonesia began to feel the loss of customers, they responded by taking strategic steps to rescue. Firmansyah et al. (2022) stated that not only credibility, print media need other strategies to retain their readers. Information consumption patterns in society will also determine how the media can survive. Without audiences as consumers, print media will find it difficult to survive in the midst of changes in society in consuming news.

Bisnis Indonesia started to seriously develop Bisnis.com starting in 2012 by establishing PT Bisnis Indonesia Sibertama (NIS), a company that manages the digital media of Bisnis Indonesia. At the same time, Bisnis Indonesia established the *Bisnis Indonesia's* Information Network (JIBI) as an integrated editorial kitchen to replace the *Bisnis Indonesia's* News Network (JBBI). JIBI functions as a reservoir for data and information that comes from the reports of journalists in the field and produces content in various forms to be broadcast on all media products managed by Bisnis Indonesia. The milestone in the implementation of the Bisnis Indonesia's convergence occurred in 2019 when Bisnis.com was used as a connecting platform by becoming the home page for all web media owned by Bisnis Indonesia. The media products owned by Bisnis Indonesia are electronic newspapers (pdf), bisnisindonesia.id (digital newspapers), bisnistv (streaming), bisnismuda.id, interaktif.bisnis.com, plus.bisnis.com, infografik.bisnis.com, hypeabis.id, context.id and dataindonesia.id. All media domain addresses reside at the top of the Bisnis.com front page. In the context of media convergence, media is a platform or vehicle used by industry to create and send messages. This applies widely in the telephone, television, movies, recorded music, magazines, and newspapers. Media convergence occurs when products typically associated with one medium appear in many media. When one can get broadcasts of the Red Sox baseball games in Boston shown on one's laptop computer and or on Android phones in Seattle, that is convergence.



Figure 1. Convergence of Bisnis Indonesia Media Products on the Bisnis.com page
Source: Bisnis.com, 2021

The implementation of convergence by Bisnis Indonesia management showed a trend of increasing business readability, increasing circulation of electronic and digital newspapers, and increasing business income from converged media products. The development of digital platforms will increase the readers of the Bisnis Indonesia group by 2021, such as Bisnis.com reaching 111,549 followers on Facebook, then more than 1.1 million followers on Twitter, more than 514 thousand followers on Instagram, and

more than 164 thousand followers on Youtube. The results of Google Analytics recorded that the number of visitors to the Bisnis.com website during November 2021 reached 88,530,158, with 62.09% of access from smartphones, 36.6% from desktops, and 0.5% from electronic tablets (Fitri, 2021).

Media convergence that collaborates with old media and new media owned by Bisnis Indonesia not only increases the number of readers but can also generate new sources of income from digital products by optimizing all managed media. In fact, the newspaper's income, which has been declining for several years, can show a rising trend again. "The management of Bisnis Indonesia is optimistic that it will set a revenue target from digital media and new media to reach 30%-40% of the company's total consolidated revenue in 2021 and increase to a minimum of 70% in the next five years. The optimism of the Bisnis Indonesia management emerged in line with the understanding and discovery of new sustainable sources of income in the media convergence model that has been implemented" (Hery Trianto, 21 September 2021). Meanwhile, the President Director of Jurnalindo Aksara Graphics, Lulu Terianto, believes that the future of Bisnis Indonesia lies in the convergence model that is currently being implemented by continuing to adopt the practices of implementing media convergence that has been successful in the world. For Bisnis Indonesia, there will be adjustments in its implementation for the unique conditions in the media environment. The view of the management of Bisnis Indonesia is relevant to relate it to the perspective that each media has its own type of convergence or is unique. The rationale is that convergence varies from country to country in the sense of culture to culture both within a country and in press companies. This is due to the factors that influence the implementation of convergence in a country or media company, such as the law and regulations (Quinn, 2005).

Table 2. Projected Bisnis Indonesia Income

Income Type	Growth Projection 2021
Advertisement	-16%
Circulation	-32%
Epaper	30%
Browse- journalistic activation product	158%
Special Report	130%
Commercial Photos	100%
BisnisIndonesia.ID- digital newspaper	100%
BisnisTV	100%
Weekly- Sunday edition newspaper	278%
Digital Monetization	134%
Premium Content	4551%
Promotion & Innovation	-37%
Commercial Videos	-97%
Context	100%

Source: Bisnis Indonesia, 2021

Bisnis Indonesia's policy to implement the convergence model is based on the demands of changing circumstances in the media environment, and there is also a belief that the convergence model can be a solution and at the same time increase the prospects for Bisnis Indonesia to grow bigger. This belief has also encouraged

management to target employee salary increases up to ten-fold in the Blueprint on “The Direction of Bisnis Indonesia in the Digital Era”. The confidence and optimism that the management of Bisnis Indonesia, on the other hand, has already been achieved by the New York Times, which has succeeded in pushing its digital products as a growth engine in building revenue streams. As of the third quarter of 2021, the New York Times has reached 7.6 million digital subscribers out of a total of 8.4 million newspaper subscribers. The development of the New York Times also shows a decline in print newspaper subscriptions to 795,000 in the third quarter of 2021 compared to 831,000 subscribers in the same period in 2020. Related to this achievement, the New York Times reported an operating profit of \$65.1 million, an increase of 15. percent in the same period. One of the factors driving the performance was an increase in revenue from newspaper subscriptions by 13.8 percent, to \$342.6 million (Harrell et al.2021). Likewise, the Washington Post added 41 new editors to strengthen its digital media by paying special attention to young readers, who are considered the most prominent readership niche they need to work on (Harrell et al.2021).

The opportunity for Bisnis Indonesia to achieve greater results in the digital market is huge. Research And Markets (2021) projects that the Southeast Asian digital advertising market will grow in 2021-2031 by 18.73%, with a value of US\$58.63 billion in 2031. This growth represents the region with the highest and largest growth in the world’s digital advertising market. The digital advertising market comes from mobile phones and mobile communication tools, desktops, Digital TV, and others. While the ad formats are digital display ads, paid searches on the internet, social media, and online videos. The development of the convergence model for Bisnis Indonesia should certainly lead to taking the advertising cake, in addition to continuing to take up advertising in print newspapers. The digital era has indeed made the opportunity to get advertisements across countries to be enlarged and prospective. However, in practice, the biggest opportunity to get it is with the big media companies, too (Müller, 2013). We can address this to the media news aggregator engine, Google. According to Geradin & Katsifis in Nugroho (2021), one of the biggest contents appearing on Google pages is mass media news. However, let alone publicly distribute profits to news publishers, Google dominates digital advertising in almost the entire world. In 2018, global advertising turnover reached US\$237 billion. Publishers earn a small amount from it. With half of the \$237 billion advertising on search engines, Google barely has competitors in this segment. Meanwhile, tens of thousands of publishers only get US\$ 46 billion and are absorbed back by advertising technology companies, including Google.

For this reason, Lulu Terianto has prepared her team to be competitive in carrying out its business strategy. One of them is sending a team to benchmark business practices and content production to a number of press companies in the United States in 2018.

“Many people feel that newspapers are not important anymore. But, in my opinion, that view is not suitable for Bisnis Indonesia. Because Bisnis Indonesia originated from newspapers and is trusted, I believe that printed newspapers need to be maintained as a medium for long content in the form of analysis. Meanwhile, dotcom or digital is a medium for concise, short, fast and accurate content. Can be a combination. So if the reader wants quick and short information, then read Bisnis.com. However, if readers want to get long information and an in-depth discussion, then they can read the printed newspaper.” (Interview with Lulu Terianto on Thursday, 7 October 2021).

Revenue Stream and Firewall

The growth of newspapers' convergence creates new sustainable revenue streams for press companies by merging new media and old media. This is in line with Mosco (2009) that the new media era, with the help of networked/digital media, allows media capitalization to be strengthened and media commercialization to increase, where media and audiences can be sold. Malmelin and Villi (2017) mentioned that collaboration between editorial and marketing in the era of convergence could eliminate the current view that distinguishes the role of journalism and the role of editorial, production, and marketing.

“Digital Bisnis Indonesia is starting to develop at this time. And then from the side of printed newspapers, it is starting to decrease. So it has to be adjusted. We are indeed looking for a business model that is better, more appropriate, and more relevant to today’s audience. Now, Digital Bisnis Indonesia in terms of audience reach is much larger than print. In the end, we realized that the media business is all about creating content relevant to the intended audience. Businesses have a very special segmentation regarding their readers. This is used as a basis for creating a different business model. Different in the sense that it can create new sources of revenue streams. From the beginning, advertising has shifted to activation products involving the community.” (Interview with Hary Trianto at Wisma Bisnis Indonesia on Wednesday, 6 October 2021).

Media convergence increases the opportunity for press companies to commodify content to take up larger media space, and the media is more receptive to any form of advertising that will be placed. This becomes more possible in digital media with unlimited space to load such commercial content. Therefore, media convergence encourages the media to provide more columns to allocate native advertising in its various variants, such as sponsored content (See Figure 2).



Figure 2. Advertising Forms in the New Media Era
Source: Marketingcraft.getcraft.com, Processed, 2021

From the discovery of various types of income for media companies in the era of convergence, the prospects for the survival of the old media, such as newspapers that

carry out mediamorphosis in the form of media convergence, are more secure. Bisnis Indonesia found this in the process of transforming into a converged media. The convergence of Bisnis Indonesia produces a promising revenue stream for the future of the newspaper. The discovery of the revenue stream has a positive effect on the welfare of employees, as indicated by the increasing receipt of salaries, bonuses, and benefits. Media convergence as a form of integration of media production and operational systems is not only seen in the commodification of content and news. However, convergence can also be seen as a strategy for press companies to create efficient products, which ultimately results in lower operating costs (Mosco, 2009).

“This process model makes the company more efficient in many ways, such as cost. One journalist can fill content for the various products and media platforms that we have.” (Interview with Fahmi Achmad, Deputy Chief Editor at Wisma Bisnis Indonesia, Jakarta on Monday, 4 October 2021).

Bisnis Indonesia increases the pool of reporters/journalists at the online desk rather than at the print newspaper desk because by placing journalists at the desk, it can produce content material for the needs of all its media products. The number of Bisnis Indonesia online reporters reached 46 out of 52 reporters they had. The remaining six reporters were not assigned to the print desk in general; they were devoted to the Weekend edition, which is published on Fridays every week, and Hypeabis.ID, which is managed by the manager of the Weekend edition. In authorizing journalists' assignments, Bisnis Indonesia gives more authority to the Bisnis.com content manager than the newspaper content manager, even though both are in the same editorial office. For instance, assignments to follow up on content issues in newspapers to online reporters must be approved by the Bisnis.com content manager.

Due to a wider space for monetizing content, newsrooms become vulnerable to problems in maintaining firewalls. The fire line is part of the code of conduct in newspaper journalism which separates advertising content and editorial content with a thick red or black line as a barrier so that readers can clearly tell which content is ordered and paid for and which content is produced by the editor as an objective service in the subjectivity of the editor to the reader (Gustafsson and Schwarz, 2013). In this case, it takes a moral commitment from the editorial management to always firmly maintain the dividing line. Firewalls in computing are certainly easier to control than in newsrooms because firewalls in computing are a function of security device systems in technical applications that help protect communication networks by filtering data input traffic and blocking outsiders from gaining access (Johansen2021). However, no matter how difficult, editorial management must distinguish between advertising and news because there is a line of fire between the two. It cannot mix it up. Therefore, journalists should not interfere in advertising matters. We have to respect it. Advertising is a profession in itself and has its own code of ethics (Harymurti, 2013). The emergence of the opportunity for press companies to increase business value as well as be a solution to the fate of print media, which is disrupted by digital media through a media convergence strategy, is a strong reason for the management of Bisnis Indonesia to be in the convergence media group. However, this risks the independence of the Bisnis Indonesia newsroom from pressure from advertisers or business partners who provide them with a turnover. Chief Editor of Bisnis Indonesia, Maria Yuliana Benyamin, said media convergence had narrowed the gap between editorial activities and marketing management work (Doyle, 2002). Such conditions are a challenge for the editorial management of Bisnis Indonesia to firmly maintain the independence of the newsroom

which has been kept autonomous from the pressures of the company's business aspects. There is a fire fence that has become a code of conduct that must be maintained by the newsroom in a press company.

“There is a very thick wall of fire between the product being sold and the editorial content. This is important to maintain the professionalism of each editor and marketing. The line of fire did not fade, but now, I saw a lot of changes taking place, where the press looks for other forms. Previously the editors worked with a full focus on content and marketing focused on product sales efforts. However, it turns out that currently there are many ways that can be done to bridge the business side of the press, such as the emergence of brand content and commercial products that are done journalistically there. Second, it must be understood that the entrance to the claim is easier to do together between the marketing and editorial teams.” (Part of the interview with Maria Yuliana Benjamin on Monday, 4 October 2021, at Wisma Bisnis Indonesia, Jakarta).

According to her, the editorial management of Bisnis Indonesia is trying so that the business run by Bisnis Indonesia daily as a press company should not suppress the way journalists work and work in the field. The newspaper business aspect cannot be ignored because it is in line with the mandate of Law Number 40 of 1999 on Press, Article 3 Paragraphs 1 and 2, which states that the national press has a function as a medium of information, education, entertainment, and social control, where in addition to these functions, the national press can function as an economic institution (Muladi, 1999). Newspapers and mass media are two inseparable sides of a coin of idealism and business reality. In press idealism, the business side of the mass media should not imprison the freedom of the press to reveal the truth of the facts on the ground. This applies to media products in any form as long as they carry out the mission of press journalism.

For Bisnis Indonesia, the challenge to the newsroom's independence is indeed a big one. From within, this media must be strong in maintaining the autonomy of its editorial room because all of its shareholders are top businesspeople. The shareholders comprise the Hotel Sahid group of hotel conglomerates, the Ciputra Developer group of property conglomerates, the media and property entrepreneur Eric Samola, and the Salim business conglomerate group. Regarding this matter, Maria admitted that the editorial management can still maintain the editors' independence. This is evidenced by the news that is not always positive. In fact, there is also negative news or criticism. Another problem faced by Bisnis Indonesia is that its characteristics as an economic and business media make it frequent to report on corporations and businesses. In the end, it has the risk of being intervened by corporations with the motivation to control news issues and discussions in the content production process which tends to defend corporations and power rather than the public interest (Mosco, 2009). Additionally, the media conglomerate that can already be attached to Bisnis Indonesia can impact content control that is in line with the interests of the media conglomerate owner (Doyle, 2002). Bisnis Indonesia, a media of convergence and media conglomeration, is challenged to remain autonomous to function as a medium of social control in its existence as an economic institution mandated by the Press Law. In this case, the content published by Bisnis Indonesia daily and the media under its auspices will be judged by the public regarding the direction of the news policy and the alignment of the content. The commitment conveyed by the editorial management elite to maintain the independence of the newsroom from any intervention will be reflected in the content broadcast through its broadcast media.

On the other hand, Bisnis Indonesia has several weaknesses in carrying out the convergence model, including (1) no foreign-language content, especially English, to make the news available to worldwide audiences. In the current era of Web 3.0 or Semantic Web, the solution does not have to provide multilingual content but can be developed using a multilingual web format (Rise, 2014). Bisnis Indonesia once had English-language content or English versions for certain news items on online sites aimed at serving English-speaking readers. However, this content was stopped from being created and served. The other weakness is that (2) Bisnis Indonesia does not provide a virtual payment system that should be available. Bisnis Indonesia's vision as an integrated information provider is an opportunity to attract buyers and customers from other countries through digital pages. The use of virtual accounts, such as PayPal, is important so that Bisnis Indonesia's electronic and digital newspapers can be sold cross-border with the help of Internet access which has opened access between people in the world to be gathered in a global village (McLuhan et al., 2011). The ad agency (Magna Group) estimates that the growth of advertising turnover in 2021, which is specifically enjoyed by digital players, will reach 35% to US\$162.4 billion.

The Challenge of Limited HR Multitasking

Media convergence also describes media as multitasking media (Verolien and Cauberghe, 2013). Therefore, the biggest challenge in implementing the media convergence model is getting multitasking human resources needed in operations. Convergence is associated with multitasking professional journalists and excessive workloads meeting content requirements for multimedia and multiplatform media (Saridou et al., 2017). A multitasking journalist is a journalist with versatile abilities to do the work of taking videos, taking photos of events, and writing reportage scripts simultaneously until it becomes content that is ready to be published by content management on its broadcast media platform. According to Saltzis and Dickinson in Kanyeki (Op.Cit), two factors cause the scarcity of multitasking journalists, including (1) expensive training costs to produce multitasking journalists because it takes time and is difficult to do. The other factor is (2) the refusal from a group of established journalists to make changes to become multitasking journalists because they feel too comfortable with the existing situation. Bisnis Indonesia has a limited number of journalists with these multitasking specifications. Building multitasking human resources is not the difficulty and problem that Bisnis Indonesia face, but almost all mass media in Indonesia face similar difficulties. There is no mass media editor who has multitasking journalists as described by Saltzis and Dickinson.

Deputy Chief Editor of Bisnis Indonesia, Rahayuningsih, admits that the media editor has not been able to apply the work of multitasking journalists, so they still separate the work for photo, video and writing journalists. The editorial management of Bisnis Indonesia still needs a long time to be able to produce multitasking HR in supporting the improvement of the implementation of convergence in Bisnis Indonesia. Successfully realizing multitasking journalism will help create efficiency and low-cost editorial operations because fewer journalists are working on various types of journalistic work (Spyridou & Veglis, 2016).

Conclusion

The convergence of Bisnis Indonesia has brought its media into the digital ecosystem intensively. The process of mediamorphosis towards convergence started with the

development of the *Bisnis.co.id* site in 1996. It expanded to the *Bisnis.com* domain, which was eventually used as a connecting platform for all media sites owned by *Bisnis Indonesia* management in 2019. The *Bisnis Indonesia* convergence was strengthened by making strategic guidelines in the form of a Blueprint entitled *Bisnis Indonesia Entering the Digital Era* version 2012 and 2015, with quite ambitious targets from editorial management and media business. From the editorial aspect, there is a roadmap to becoming a multimedia company with professional, pragmatic principles in media product development.

Meanwhile, from the commercial aspect, *Bisnis Indonesia* is developed into a profitable press company by developing core and non-core business units that are integrated with efficient and effective operations. The intermediate target that the management of *Bisnis Indonesia* wants to achieve is to be able to increase employee salaries up to 10 times the result of healthy business growth. The convergence carried out by *Bisnis Indonesia* until 2021 can be a solution for increasing and expanding the reader base, increasing circulation of electronic and digital newspapers, and increasing revenue through sustainable revenue streams from the digital ecosystem. In this case, the Marketing Director, Hery Trianto, said that the success was shown by the company's ability to pay salaries much higher than the provisions of the Provincial Minimum Wage, to give bonuses twice a year, to give THR twice a year, and to provide other forms of incentives to employees.

Nevertheless, in the clearest view, it is known that the convergence of *Bisnis Indonesia* has a risk of disrupting the newsroom's independence because editorial management collaborates with marketing management in seeking revenue streams from media products developed by editors. This will be a serious concern for the sustainability of the media as a means of social control in public. In this regard, Chief Editor Maria Yuliana Benyamin stated the editorial commitment to maintaining the newsroom's independence in safeguarding the public interest in terms of news policies or content production.

Furthermore, the convergence of *Bisnis Indonesia* to the present stage still have some rooms for improvement. There are at least three main things that need to be resolved, including (1) providing foreign language content, especially English, so that *Bisnis Indonesia* could reach wider audiences worldwide; (2) providing a virtual payment system, such as Paypal, which *Bisnis Indonesia* does not currently have; (3) and providing multitasking journalists who are an important part of the media convergence system.

Acknowledgement

The researchers would like to express their gratitude to the University of Riau, in particular to the Postgraduate Program and Communication Studies Study Program, *Bisnis Indonesia Daily*, and the *Serikat Perusahaan Pers* (Press Company Union).

References

- Baran, J. Davis, D. K. (2010). *Mass Communication Theory: Foundations, Ferment, and Future*, Cengage Learning.
- Biagi, S. (2015). *Media/Impact: An Introduction to Mass Media*. Cengage Learning, Stamford, Amerika Serikat.
- Chano, T. M., & Paramita, S. (2019). Transformasi Komunikasi Politik Melalui Media Sosial Instagram (Studi terhadap Akun@ karyaadalahdoa). *Koneksi*, 3(1), 176–

181.

- Dahlgren, P. (2013). *The Political Web Media, Participation and Alternative Democracy*, Palgrave Macmillan, London.
- Doyle, G. (2002). *Media ownership: The economics and politics of convergence and concentration in the UK and European media*. Sage.
- Fidler, R. F. (1997). *Mediamorphosis: Understanding new media*. Pine Forge Press.
- Firmansyah, F., Novita, S., Rachmiatie, A., K., S., Sobur, A., & Putri, D. (2022). How the Print Media Industry Survived in the Digital Era. *Jurnal ASPIKOM*, 7(1), 1-15. <http://dx.doi.org/10.24329/aspikom.v7i1.1013>.
- Fitri, S. (2021). *Bisnis.com Performance Update 2021*. PT NIS. Jakarta.
- Nugroho, I. (2021). The Dynamics of Mass Media Resistance toward Google. *Jurnal ASPIKOM*, 6(2), 278-291. <http://dx.doi.org/10.24329/aspikom.v6i2.856>
- Gustafsson, Veronika. Schwarz, E. J. (2013). *Business Modelling and Convergence 2, dalam Media and Convergence Management*, Editor: Diehl, Sandra. Karmasin, Matthias. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.
- Haq, A. D., & Fadilah, E. (2018). Transformasi Harian Kompas Menjadi Portal Berita Digital Subscription Kompas. Id. *Jurnal Kajian Jurnalisme*, 1(2).
- Harrell, K. N., Vervoort, D., Luc, J. G. Y., Tracy, B. M., & Daniel Stanley, J. (2021). Social media in surgery. *The American Surgeon*, 87(7), 1021–1024.
- Harymurti, B. (2013). *Hati-Hati dengan Wartawan Berprofesi Ganda, dalam Pers Berkualitas, Masyarakat Cerdas*, Editor: Nugroho, Bakti. Samsuri. Dewan Pers. Jakarta.
- Jenkins, H. (2016). *Convergence Culture Where Old and New Media Collide* (Vol. 4, Issue 1). new york university press.
- Johansen, A. G. (2021). *What is a firewall? Firewalls explained and why you need one*. <https://us.norton.com/internetsecurity-emerging-threats-what-is-firewall.html>.
- Kanyeki, J. W. (2017). Overcoming Convergence in East Africa's Media Houses: The Case of the Standard Media Group. In *Digital Transformation in Journalism and News Media* (pp. 69–85). Springer.
- Lexy J, M. (2018).). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif, Remaja Rosdakarya, Bandung*.
- Malmelin, N., & Villi, M. (2017). Media work in change: Understanding the role of media professionals in times of digital transformation and convergence. *Sociology Compass*, 11(7), 1–9. <https://doi.org/10.1111/soc4.12494>
- Marshall, M. (1962). *The Gutenberg Galaxy: The Making of Typographic Man*. University of Toronto Press, Scholarly, Kanada.
- McLuhan, M., Gordon, W. T., Lamberti, E., & Scheffel-Dunand, D. (2011). *The Gutenberg galaxy: The making of typographic man*. University of Toronto Press.
- McPhillips, S., & Merlo, O. (2008). Media convergence and the evolving media business model: an overview and strategic opportunities. *The Marketing Review*, 8(3), 237–253. <https://doi.org/10.1362/146934708x337663>
- Mosco, V. (2009). *Political Economy of Communication*, SAGE Publications Ltd, London.
- Muladi. (1999). *Undang-Undang No.40 Tahun 1999 Tentang Pers. Sekretariat Negara*. Jakarta.
- Müller, J. (2013). *Mechanisms of trust: News media in democratic and authoritarian regimes*. Campus Verlag.
- Naik, U. (2014). Comparative Study of Web 1.0, Web 2.0 and Web 3.0. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/264845599> Comparative, March

2009. <https://doi.org/10.13140/2.1.2287.2961>
- O'Reilly, T. (2012). What is web 2.0?: Design patterns and business models for the next generation of software. *The Social Media Reader*, 65, 32–52.
- Pavlik, J. V., & McIntosh, S. (2004). Converging media. *An Introduction to Mass Communication*.
- Quinn, S. (2005). Convergent Journalism: An Introduction. In *Writing and Producing Across Media* (p.). Elsevier Ltd.
- Saridou, T., Spyridou, L.-P., & Veglis, A. (2017). Churnalism on the rise? Assessing convergence effects on editorial practices. *Digital Journalism*, 5(8), 1006–1024.
- Shapiro michael. (2011). *The Newspaper That Almost Seized the Future*, https://archives.cjr.org/feature/the_newspaper_that_almost_seized_the_future.php
- Shawn, John v . Mcintosh, P. (2017). *Converging Media : A New Introduction to Mass Communication*, Oxford University Press, London.
- Spyridou, L., & Veglis, A. (2016). Media Convergence Handbook - Vol. 1. *Media Convergence Handbook - Vol. 1, 1*, 99–116. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-54484-2>
- Sudibyoy, A. (2019). *Jagat Digital: Pembebasan dan Penguasaan*. Kepustakaan populer gramedia.
- Sugiyono. (2012). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif Kuantitatif dan R & D*. Alfabeta.
- Turow, Joseph. (2014). *Media Today: Mass Communication In A Converging*. Routledge.New York.
- Verolien, Snezhanka. Cauberghe, K. (2013). *Media Convergence and Media Multitasking, dalam Media and Convergence Management, Editor: Diehl, Sandra. Karmasin, Matthias. Springer-Verlag, Berlin*.
- Wangeci Jennifeer, K. (2017). *Overcoming Convergence in East Africa's Media Houses: The Case of the Standard Media Group, dalam Digital Transformation in Journalism and News Media: Media Management, Media Convergence and Globalization, Editor: Friedrichsen, Mike. Kamalipour, Yahya. Ch*.
- Wicaksono, T., Nugroho, A. D., Lakner, Z., Dunay, A., & Illés, C. B. (2021). Word of mouth, digital media, and open innovation at the agricultural SMEs. *Journal of Open Innovation: Technology, Market, and Complexity*, 7(1), 91.