

Tempo's Watchdog Journalism toward the Indonesian Government's Policy on COVID-19

Muhammad Dicka Ma'arief Alyatalatthaf*, Natalia Faradheta Putri

Institut Teknologi dan Bisnis Kalbis, Jakarta Timur, Indonesia

*Corresponding author, e-mail: muhammad.alyatalatthaf@kalbis.ac.id

Abstract

The second wave of COVID-19 hit Indonesia in July 2021. Tempo magazine published five editions about it throughout July-August 2021. This study aims to see how Tempo magazine frames its news about government policies in dealing with the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia. This research uses Robert M. Entman's framing analysis model. The results showed that the government is inconsiderate and irresponsible to the current conditions of COVID-19. Accordingly, the government is inconsistent in implementing PPKM (lockdown). They are too focused on an economic recovery that they are planning on the COVID-19 therapeutic drugs and vaccination business, and there is a lack of coordination in the government body. Through its news framing, Tempo also carries out the function of watchdog journalism, which is implemented in three dimensions: the intensity of the scrutiny, the journalistic voice, and the source of the news event.

Keywords: COVID-19, Framing Analysis, Tempo Magazine, Watchdog Journalism

Abstrak

Gelombang kedua COVID-19 melanda Indonesia pada Juli 2021. Majalah Tempo menerbitkan lima edisi sepanjang Juli-Agustus 2021 yang membahas mengenai kebijakan pemerintah dalam menangani gelombang kedua COVID-19 di Indonesia. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk melihat bagaimana majalah Tempo membingkai pemberitaannya mengenai kebijakan pemerintah dalam menghadapi gelombang kedua COVID-19 di Indonesia. Peneliti menggunakan analisis framing model Robert M. Entman. Hasil dari penelitian ini, isu yang paling ditonjolkan Tempo antara lain, pemerintah tak peka dan tak cepat tanggap mengenai kondisi terkini COVID-19, pemerintah dinilai setengah hati dalam menerapkan PPKM, pemerintah dinilai terlalu fokus pada pemulihan ekonomi, bahkan berencana berbisnis obat terapi COVID-19 dan membisniskan vaksinasi, serta kekacauan koordinasi dalam tubuh pemerintah. Tempo melalui framing pemberitaannya juga melaksanakan fungsi watchdog journalism yang diimplementasikan dalam tiga dimensi, yakni: intensity of the scrutiny; the journalistic voice; dan source of the news event.

Kata Kunci: COVID-19, Analisis Framing, Majalah Tempo, Watchdog Journalism

Introduction

The COVID-19 (Coronavirus disease of 2019) pandemic, which has plagued almost all countries globally, has yet to find any signs of abating until the second half of 2021. Since the first case in Wuhan, Hubei, China, in December 2019, COVID-19 infection has been recorded as high as 198.234.951 confirmed cases and has claimed 4.227.359 lives as of 2 August 2021, at 10:19 WIB (Salvetat et al., 2021; WHO, 2020). On 3 August 2021, there were 3.496.700 confirmed cases with a total death toll of 98.889 in Indonesia. This figure is quite prominent because Indonesia occupied the 14th position out of 220 countries worldwide in terms of confirmed cases of COVID-19. The daily cases also occupied the second position with the number of additional cases of 33.900, below Iran with 39.019 cases. Unfortunately, Indonesia occupied the first position for death cases of 1.598, far above Russia, with death cases of 788 in second place (Worldmeter, 2021).

The high number of confirmed cases of COVID-19 in Indonesia is certainly not without any reason. The Indonesian government is relatively slow in deciding policies regarding the pandemic. Instead, they tend to underestimate it. This is reflected in how the government responded to the first case of COVID-19 in Indonesia on 2 March 2020. The Indonesian Minister of Health at the time, Terawan Agus Putranto, appealed to the public to “enjoy it” instead of giving an early warning and referring to COVID-19 as “a blessing from the Almighty” (Almuttaqi, 2020). The government is considered very slow in determining the status of COVID-19 as a national disaster, which was only announced on 17 April 2020 or one month and 15 days since the emergence of the first case in Indonesia. The government’s delay in mitigation efforts was also highlighted by the WHO (World Health Organization), which, since February 2020, has reprimanded and claimed the Indonesian government had failed to detect COVID-19 earlier (Marina, 2021; Tuwu et al., 2021).

PSBB (Large-Scale Social Restrictions) is also considered ineffective because in its application, it is not the same as the total lockdown as carried out by China. IDI (Indonesian Doctors Association) has also provided recommendations to the government to implement a total lockdown, but President Joko Widodo has ignored it. The reason is that the total lockdown will not guarantee success in suppressing the spread of COVID-19 (Khoerunisa & Noorikhshan, 2021). President Joko Widodo, in an interview on a television program, Mata Najwa, challenged by saying, “*point out which country has successfully implemented ‘lockdown’ and can stop this problem (COVID-19), I don’t think there is any, is there? Show me? There is none*” (Mata Najwa, 2020). Unfortunately, President Joko Widodo’s statement was made in April 2020, or four months since the first case of COVID-19 was discovered in Wuhan. This means that the lockdowns implemented by several countries globally have not shown any impact yet, and studies that show the effectiveness have not been published.

Mellone et al. (2021) in Nature journal stated that the duration of the lockdown varies from country to country. In this study, Mellone also offered a model of a lockdown scheme with a minimum duration of 50 days to have a significant impact. Effective lockdowns have also been seen in several countries like Norway, New Zealand, America, Israel, Spain, England, Australia, Romania, and Hungary (Bloomberg, 2021; Kerekes, 2021). Thus, President Joko Widodo’s statement questioning the effectiveness of the lockdown is no longer relevant.

In addition to the inconsistencies in the lockdown implementation through PSBB, the government’s problems in handling the pandemic are also visible in other sectors.

Lack of readiness in health facilities such as Personal Protective Equipment for medical workers, lack of coordination between the central and regional governments, poor 3T (Tracking, Tracing, and Testing) capabilities, lack of government transparency regarding COVID-19 data, to corruption in social assistance (Almuttaqi, 2020; Hidayat et al., 2021; Tempo, 2021).

The policies and problems in handling the COVID-19 pandemic in Indonesia are certainly highlighted by the mass media, one of which is Tempo Magazine which has highlighted the government's policy in handling COVID-19 since March 2020. This study will focus on Tempo's news throughout July 2021. It coincides with Indonesia's second wave of COVID-19, since 3 July 2021 (Tempo.co, 2021). Tempo had published five issues of the magazine which discussed government policies in dealing with the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia.

In its reports, Tempo magazine applies the concept of watchdog journalism. This concept is defined as journalism that acts as a keeper of the government policies and actions, both individually and institutionally. Journalists play their watchdog role by exposing abuses, corruption, fraud, waste, maladministration, or government malfeasance (Siddique & Rahman, 2017). Watchdog journalism is also acknowledged as one of the most important contributions of the press to support democracy. It reflects the interests of various organizations to make democracy more transparent and powerful actors accountable to citizens (Şen, 2021). This function is a democracy strengthening mechanism that acts as The Fourth Estate, or the fourth pillar of power of a country after the executive, legislative, and judiciary in balancing power through criticism (bad conditions) and control (political, business, and community) (Hanitzsch, 2005; Vaca-Baqueiro, 2018). The public has the right to obtain information with a balanced portion in terms of education, intellectual establishment, character, and morals (Ma'arief Alyatalathaf, 2018). These things are in accordance with the mandate of the Indonesian press in Law No. 40 of 1999 concerning the Press in Article 3 (1), which reads, the national press has a function as a medium of information, education, entertainment, and social control.

Previous research on watchdog journalism entitled "Pandemic Journalism: A Study of COVID-19 News Coverage on *detik.com*" mentions that the media can act as a "watchdog" to monitor every narrative and government policy handling the pandemic. It appeared in an article entitled "Anticipation of the Corona Virus, Tightened Imports from China!" on 27 January 2020. *Detik.com* provides notes and encourages the government to be vigilant and anticipate the coronavirus. Criticism in a reasonable manner will help the government and society deal with the pandemic. In the other article, "Menkes Prepares 100 Hospitals to Handle Corona Virus", *detik.com* encourages the government to make policies based on facts, field data and stands for public interest especially vulnerable groups (Woda et al., 2021).



Figure 1. Tempo Magazine July 2021 Issues

The five titles of Tempo magazine above were published in order. This means that during July 2021, Tempo magazine made the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia as the main topic, four of which contained critics to the government. The researchers were interested in seeing how Tempo magazine frames news about government policies dealing with the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia. Based on the explanation above, the purpose of this study is to see how Tempo magazine frames their news of government policies in dealing with the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia and how Tempo magazine carries out the function of watchdog journalism in its reports.

Method

This study uses a qualitative research method with a descriptive approach that focuses on how humans interpret everything in the world. The paradigm used in this study is constructivism, a set of beliefs useful to guide researchers in researching from a relative ontology perspective (Denzin & Lincoln, 2018).

The analytical method used in this research is the framing model analysis of Robert M. Entman, which focus on four areas: (1) define a problem (how the problem is seen, as what); (2) diagnose causes (source of the problem, who is the actor/what causes); (3) make moral judgment (moral decisions to legitimize or delegitimize cases); (4) treatment recommendation (emphasizing the solution, the solution offered) (Eriyanto, 2018).

The framing analysis approach in this study is at the cultural level. The analysis is carried out by identifying and categorizing the repetition process of information, placement, association, and sharpening in terms of words, sentences, and certain propositions in a discourse. In this case, the operationalization of discourse is observed through semantic, schematic, graphic, rhetorical meanings, metaphors, phrases, syllogisms, and other symbolic dimensions (Sobur, 2018). In other words, framing is a selection process of reality that can make certain realities stand out (salience) compared to other realities (Eriyanto, 2018; Sobur, 2018).

This study used Tempo magazine as the object of analysis, which consists of five issues published in July 2021. From these five issues, the researchers focused on the Main Report rubric, so that in total, there were five news articles analyzed.

Table 1. Unit of Analysis

No	Issue	Issue Title	Article Title
1.	28 June-4 July 2021	“ <i>Gelombang Kedua</i> ” (<i>Second wave</i>)	Serangan Kedua dari <i>Delta</i> (<i>second attack from delta</i>)
2.	5-11 July 2021	“ <i>Intrik Ivermectin</i> ”	Gonjang-ganjing Obat Cacing (earthquake of athelmintic)
3.	12-18 July 2021	“ <i>Bisakah Kita Bertahan</i> ” (<i>can we last</i>)	Robohnya Rumah Sakit Kami (the fall of our hospital)
4.	19-25 July 2021	“ <i>Ambyar Vaksin Berbayar</i> ” (desperate paid vaccine)	Gotong-royong Penuh Pamrih (selfless cooperation)
5.	26 July-1 Agustus 2021	“ <i>AbraKadabra Data Corona</i> ”	Dusta Angka Corona (deceitful corona data)

Results and Discussion

In this section, the five news articles from the five issues of Tempo magazine in July 2021 are analyzed using Robert M. Entman’s framing model analysis which focuses on the scope of defining problems, diagnosing causes, making moral judgments, and treatment recommendations in the following table.

Table 2. Analysis of Tempo Magazine 28 June-4 July 2021 Issue “*Gelombang Kedua*”

Framing Robert M. Entman	Article Title: “Serangan Kedua dari Delta”
Define Problem	The Coronavirus tsunami or the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia is thought to be triggered by the spread of the Delta variant or the B.1.617.2 virus originating from India. This virus can spread 60-70% faster than non-variants originating from Wuhan, China. As of mid-June, the delta variant has been found in 92 countries.
Diagnose Causes	The delta variant was not immediately responded to by the government. When this variant raged in India, the Ministry of Transportation did not immediately close flight access to and from India. The government only made a move when there were 12 people tested positive for COVID-19 from more than 100 Indians who entered Indonesia by a charter plane.
Make Moral Judgement	The government is inconsiderate over the development of the COVID-19 virus globally. In addition, the government was inconsistent in implementing the quarantine, which should have been 14 days to only five days. In addition, the government rejected the proposal to close international flights due to maintaining bilateral relations.
Treatment Recommendation	The government through the Coordinating Minister for the Economy, Airlangga Hartarto, finally decided to close international flights from India after 12 people tested positive for COVID-19 on a charter flight that carried more than 100 people from India.

In the article entitled “*Serangan Kedua dari Delta*” (trans: Second Attack from Delta), Tempo explained the cause of the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia, which was allegedly triggered by the Delta variant from India in define problem. In this article, Tempo also informed about the ferocity of the Delta variant by comparing the speed level of the variant spreads to the coronavirus originating from Wuhan, China. Tempo used the word Delta as the article’s title to emphasize the cause of the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia.

After explaining the natural causes of the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia, Tempo then highlighted the government’s policy as a non-natural cause in the diagnosis cause frame due to the government’s late response to handling the Delta variant. Before spreading to other countries in continental Europe, Africa, and Asia, including Indonesia, the Delta variant had a rage in India in May 2021, infecting up to 391.000 people in a single day (Nature.com, 2021; Sheikh et al., 2021). Tempo also framed the Ministry of Transportation as the guilty party for not immediately closing the international borders, especially to and from India. As a result, 12 Indians were found positive for COVID-19 on a flight of more than a hundred Indians who entered Indonesia through Soekarno-Hatta Airport with a charter plane on 21 April 2021.

The Minister of Transportation, Budi Karya Sumadi, said that Indonesia still had to transport logistical needs such as oxygen and vaccines. International borders, especially from and to India, were not closed when the COVID-19 cases in India were reported. However, in making a moral judgment frame, Tempo viewed that the statement by the Minister of Transportation was just an excuse. Tempo uses “making an excuse” in Budi Karya Sumadi’s statement. Tempo assessed that the government’s responsiveness was due to Indonesia’s efforts to maintain bilateral relations between countries, in this case, India and other countries, as transit points for Indian citizens before entering Indonesia. This was evident in the KPC-PEN (Covid-19 Control Committee and National Economic Recovery) meeting at the end of April 2021. There was a discussion about closing international borders to and from a number of countries suspected of being exposed to the Delta variant, such as the UAE (United Arab Emirates), Saudi Arabia, and Malaysia. Based on Tempo’s investigation, international travelers other than India were only subject to 5 x 24 hours of quarantine, even though quarantine should be carried out for 14 days according to the virus’s incubation period in the WHO guidelines. Based on this explanation, Tempo constructed the government’s inconsistent policy in implementing quarantine regulations and way of dealing with the COVID-19 pandemic in Indonesia.

Tempo’s emphasis on treatment recommendations could be seen in the solutions mentioned after discovering 12 people with COVID on a flight from India on 21 April 2021. Through the Coordinating Minister for the Economic, Airlangga Hartarto, the government finally decided to close international flights to and from India. The government was said to have only made a move after finding 12 positive cases of COVID-19 on the flight. Tempo used the phrase “only made a move” to describe how slow the government made decisions.

Table 3. Analysis of Tempo Magazine 5-11 July 2021 Issue “Intrik Ivermectin”

Framing Robert M. Entman	Article Title: “Gonjang-ganjing Obat Cacing”
Define Problem	PT Harsen Laboratories as the producer of the Ivermectin drug, lobbied a number of high-ranking state officials such as the Ministry of Defense and the Presidential Staff Office to encourage Ivermectin as a preventive and therapeutic drug against COVID-19. PT Harsen also intended to sponsor Pertahanan University for clinical trials because they claimed the Ministry of Health did not want to support the research.
Diagnose Causes	BPOM (Indonesia’s FDA) conducted an unannounced inspection of PT Harsen Laboratories factory on Tuesday, 29 June 2021. The inspection was carried out because PT Harsen did not respond to supervision and guidance, including summons. BPOM was also said to have found violations committed by PT Harsen in the Ivermectin production process.
Make Moral Judgement	The meeting between PT Harsen and the Minister of SOEs (BUMN), Erick Thohir, was seen as a business competition so that Ivermectin could become a COVID-19 drug. However, PT Harsen accused the Ministry of Health of rejecting Ivermectin’s clinical trials because it was feared that it would compete head-to-head with vaccines that have become government policy in dealing with COVID-19.
Treatment Recommendation	SOEs Minister Erick Thohir, with the approval of President Joko Widodo, wrote to BPOM to issue a distribution permit for Ivermectin as a COVID-19 drug. On 28 June 2021, BPOM also allowed clinical trials of Ivermectin in eight hospitals. Erick Thohir had also met with the head of PT Harsen to make an agreement.

In the article “Gonjang-ganjing Obat Cacing”, Tempo highlighted the business lobbies carried out by PT Harsen Laboratories as the producer of Ivermectin in the defined problem frame. PT Harsen was reported to have lobbied a number of state officials such as the Ministry of Defense and met directly with the personal doctor of the Minister of Defense, Prabowo Subianto. During the meeting, PT Harsen gave ten bottles of Ivermax 12 as samples. Later, PT Harsen was asked to bring another 180 bottles and asked to present their products in front of 27 generals and 110 directors of army hospitals in Indonesia. Tempo emphasized these meetings as business lobbying by using the word “*mengegolkan*” (trans: to succeed the deal of) the use of Ivermectin as a drug for prevention and therapy against COVID-19 in Indonesia.

Tempo linked PT Harsen’s lobbies with a number of state officials to BPOM’s (Food and Drug Supervisory Agency) inspection in diagnosing cause analysis by stating that BPOM had carried out a sudden inspection of PT Harsen’s factory on Tuesday, 29 June 2021. The inspection was carried out because PT Harsen did not respond to supervision and guidance, including summons. BPOM was also said to have found violations committed by PT Harsen in the Ivermectin production process, such as illegally imported raw materials for Ivermax 12, distribution of drugs without using official channels, the non-standard packaging of Ivermax 12, and falsification of expiration dates. The links of the two cases also answered why PT Harsen lobbied a number of state officials directly, nothing but to smooth out legalizing Ivermax 12 as a

drug to treat COVID-19 avoid inspections all accusations from BPOM.

In addition to political lobbying, PT Harsen's lobbies are also seen as business competition. Tempo frames this in making moral judgments. Previously, it was informed that the Vice President of PT Harsen, Sofia Koswara, said that the Ministry of Health did not want to support the Ivermectin clinical trial. Sofia accused the rejection of Ivermectin clinical trials because the Ministry of Health was worried that Ivermectin would compete head-to-head with vaccines, which have become government policies in dealing with COVID-19. On the other hand, SOEs Minister, Erick Thohir, was also aggressively proposing Ivermectin as a COVID-19 drug through the production of PT Indofarma Tbk. This series of information confirms Tempo's framing that various stakeholders, including the Ministry of SOEs, are competing in the COVID-19 drug business in Indonesia.

In the treatment recommendation, Tempo highlighted the solution by the government regarding the Ivermectin polemic. SOEs Minister Erick Thohir, with the approval of President Joko Widodo, wrote to BPOM to issue a distribution permit for Ivermectin as a COVID-19 drug. Erick claimed the drug has been used in a number of countries and has shown positive results in overcoming COVID-19. At the end of June 2021, BPOM finally allowed clinical trials of Ivermectin in eight hospitals in Indonesia. Erick Thohir has also met with the head of PT Harsen to make an agreement. This could be seen as a win-win solution in the COVID-19 drug business between PT Harsen Laboratories, BPOM, Ministry of Health, the Ministry of SOEs, and PT Indofarma Tbk—the (BUMN) SOEs pharmaceutical holding company—which is a subsidiary of PT Bio Farma as the SOEs pharmaceutical company in Indonesia (Welley et al., 2021).

Table 4. Analysis of Tempo Magazine 12-18 July 2021 Issue "*Bisakah Kita Bertahan*"

Framing Robert M. Entman	Article Title: "Robohnya Rumah Sakit Kami"
Define Problem	Health care facilities collapsed when the number of Coronavirus infections soared during the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia. Almost all hospital occupancy in Java-Bali had been filled, oxygen stocks were critical, and dozens of doctors, nurses, and other health workers have died from COVID-19 infection.
Diagnose Causes	The explosion in the number of COVID-19 cases, especially on the island of Java, had been predicted since May 2021. At that time, an increase was seen after the Eid holiday. Minister of Health, Budi Gunadi Sadikin, proposed population mobility restrictions, but the proposal was rejected because it would interfere with economic recovery.
Make Moral Judgement	The government has been considered too focused on balancing health care with economic recovery, so the main priority is no longer on handling the COVID-19 pandemic. In addition, government policies have also been not well-coordinated. This is because there are many disagreements and policy contradictions between government officials.
Treatment Recommendation	The government tried to increase the capacity of beds specifically for COVID-19 patients, provide booster injections for health workers, and increase the number of nurses for hospitals.

Tempo Magazine 12-18 July 2021 Issue used erotesis in the title of its edition, “Bisakah Kita Bertahan”. Erotesis language, commonly known as the rhetorical question, is a question used in speech or writing to achieve a deeper emphasis effect. It does not require an answer at all (Keraf, 2007). In this regard, Tempo tried to emphasize the critical condition of Indonesia when it comes to the second wave of COVID-19. In fact, it can be interpreted that Tempo is constructing the worst possibility, that Indonesia cannot survive and has been declared to have collapsed. In using the erotesis style, the assumption is that there is only one possible answer (Keraf, 2007).

The title of Tempo magazine, which was framed in a dystopia in this edition, was supported by news about the critical condition of handling COVID-19 in Indonesia. Article entitled “Robohnya Rumah Sakit Kami” in define problem highlighted the collapse of health care facilities, 90% of hospital occupancy in Java-Bali, critical oxygen stocks, as well as dozens of doctors, nurses, and other health workers passing from COVID-19 infection.

In diagnose cause frame, Tempo determined that the leading cause of the collapse was inconsistent government policies in dealing with the pandemic. The explosive number of COVID-19 cases, especially on the island of Java, had been predicted since May 2021. At that time, an increase was seen after the Eid holiday. In addition, in March 2021, the government discovered that the coronavirus’s Delta variant had entered Indonesia. Minister of Health, Budi Gunadi Sadikin, had also proposed population mobility restrictions in May 2021. However, the proposal was rejected because it was considered to interfere with the economic recovery. Coordinating Minister for the Economy, Airlangga Hartarto, stated from the beginning that he had different views on the Emergency PPKM (Enforcement of Restrictions on Community Activities). He initially suggested that malls and restaurants remain open with limited operating hours. In the end, with many considerations, Coordinating Minister for Maritime Affairs, Luhut Binsar, who is also the Coordinator of the Java-Bali PPKM on 1 July 2021, decided to close malls and restaurants during Emergency PPKM temporarily.

Through these reports, Tempo tried to frame the chaos in policy coordination between government officials responsible for handling the COVID-19 pandemic to make a moral judgment frame. In addition, the government was considered overly focused on balancing health care with economic recovery. Thus, the main priority was no longer handling the COVID-19 pandemic, so the prevention and control efforts were not optimal.

Responding to the critical condition of handling COVID-19 in Indonesia, Tempo summarized the government’s solution in the treatment recommendation. The government tried to increase the capacity of beds specifically for COVID-19 patients, work with stakeholders to produce medical oxygen all over Indonesia, look for oxygen supplies to Singapore, provide booster injections for health workers, and increase the number of nurses for hospitals. Unfortunately, there was no solution or response given by the government regarding the poor policy coordination between government officials responsible for dealing with the COVID-19 pandemic. Though the article stated that the Minister of Health, Budi Gunadi, mentioned the dynamic discussion on emergency PPKM directed by President Joko Widodo himself, the chaos in coordination was evident, including what was exposed in Tempo news.

Table 5. Analysis of Tempo Magazine 19-25 July 2021 Issue “*Ambyar Vaksin Berbayar*”

Framing Robert M. Entman	Article Title: “Gotong-royong Penuh Pamrih”
Define Problem	The government issued Permenkes No. 19 of 2021 regarding paid independent vaccinations carried out through the pharmacy network of PT Kimia Farma. This program had also been criticized by many parties, including political parties, workers, non-governmental organizations, to the WHO.
Diagnose Causes	The plan of paid vaccines has been conveyed by President Joko Widodo since 19 October 2020. From here, the Mutual Cooperation Vaccination (Vaksin Gotong Royong) program was formed, and the payment scheme should be done by the company. Later, paid independent vaccines emerged in the KPC-PEN meeting chaired by Coordinating Minister for the Economy, Airlangga Hartarto, and attended by Minister of Health Budi Gunadi Sadikin.
Make Moral Judgement	Paid independent vaccination is considered a profit-making project in the midst of a pandemic. PT Kimia Farma—a subsidiary of Bio Farma, a pharmaceutical BUMN holding—ran a paid vaccination program that took up to 20% profit. Tempo calculated that the potential profit obtained was around 1 trillion rupiahs.
Treatment Recommendation	President Joko Widodo held a limited meeting with Coordinating Minister for Maritime Affairs (Luhut Binsar), Coordinating Minister for Human Development and Culture (Muhadjir Effendy), Coordinating Minister for the Economy who is also Chair of KPC-PEN (Airlangga Hartarto), Minister of Health (Budi Gunadi), and Minister of SOEs (Erick Thohir). He expressed his frustration at PT Kimia Farma, then canceled the paid independent vaccine on 16 July 2021.

After sharply highlighting the government’s response to the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia, Tempo highlighted a government program that has drawn criticism from various circles in society, namely the paid Mutual Cooperation Vaccination Program (Vaksin Gotong Royong) in the article “Gotong-royong Penuh Pamrih”. In define problem, Tempo framed the Permenkes (Minister of Health Regulation) No. 19 of 2021 regarding paid independent vaccinations carried out through PT Kimia Farma network. The vaccination service started on Monday, 12 July 2021, and was available at eight Kimia Farma pharmacies using the Sinopharm vaccine. The cost for one dose was Rp 439.570, - or Rp 880.000, - for two doses. Kimia Farma claimed that paid vaccines were in demand. In fact, according to a government official, the community resistance to the program was high. This program had also been criticized by many parties, including political parties, workers, non-governmental organizations, and the WHO.

Through diagnosing causes, Tempo explained the initial purpose of the paid vaccination program. It was stated that the plan on paid vaccines had been conveyed by President Joko Widodo since 19 October 2020. The President said that there were free vaccines, but some were not. Free vaccines were managed by the Ministry of Health, while the Ministry of SOEs handled the paid ones. However, on 16 December 2020, the President changed his plan and unpaid all vaccines. One month later, on 13 January

2021, the chairman of the Indonesian Chamber of Commerce and Industry, Rosan Perkasa Roeslani, met the President at the State Palace. During the meeting, Rosan addressed the need to involve the private sector in vaccination to accelerate herd immunity. This was where the Mutual Cooperation Vaccination program was formed, in which the company carried out the payment scheme. Recently, efforts to activate paid independent vaccines had emerged again. This happened during the KPC-PEN meeting chaired by Coordinating Minister for the Economy, Airlangga Hartarto, attended by Minister of Health Budi Gunadi Sadikin, on 26 June 2021. Two days later, the meeting results were brought to a limited meeting attended by President Joko Widodo. Finally, on Monday, 5 July 2021, Permenkes No. 19 of 2021 allows Mutual Cooperation Vaccination Program for self-paying individuals. In this case, Coordinating Minister for the Economy, Airlangga Hartarto, was again highlighted as the main actor behind the idea of the paid independent vaccine. This is because, in the meeting, Tempo only mentioned Coordinating Minister Airlangga and Minister of Health Budi Gunadi as the government officials. Budi Gunadi also stated that he disagreed with the program, but the pressure from his colleagues was strong enough that Budi Gunadi signed the regulation. That way, Coordinating Minister, Airlangga immediately became the sole actor in Tempo's reporting frame.

Tempo claimed this individual Mutual Cooperation Vaccination Program in making a moral judgment as a profit-making project in the midst of a pandemic. PT Kimia Farma—a state-owned pharmaceutical holding company—a subsidiary of PT Bio Farma (Welley et al., 2021) as a company that runs a paid vaccination program was reported to have made a profit of up to 20%. This margin was stated in the Decree of the Minister of Health No. HK.01.07/MENKES/4643/2021. Tempo calculated that the potential profit of PT Kimia Farma was around up to 1 trillion rupiahs. The chairman of the Corruption Eradication Commission (KPK), Firli Bahuri, claimed that the paid independent vaccination program could be fraudulent in terms of planning, ratification, implementation, and evaluation. He expressed this opinion in a meeting on 12 July 2021 with the Coordinating Minister for Maritime Affairs (Luhut Binsar), Minister of SOEs (Erick Thohir), and a number of other ministers.

Responding to criticisms and polemics for paid independent vaccines, in the treatment recommendation, Tempo reported that President Joko Widodo held a limited meeting with Coordinating Minister for Maritime Affairs (Luhut Binsar), Coordinating Minister for Human Development and Culture (Muhadjir Effendy), Coordinating Minister for the Economy and Chair of KPC-PEN (Airlangga Hartarto), Minister of Health (Budi Gunadi), and Minister of SOEs (Erick Thohir). During the meeting, the President expressed his frustration at PT Kimia Farma. According to the President, PT Kimia Farma did not properly socialize the paid independent vaccine program, thus creating negative perception of the program. After nearly a week of polemics, the President decided to cancel paid independent vaccines on 16 July 2021. This case also supported the evidence that coordination in handling the pandemic, vaccination, and public communication within the government and other related agencies was indeed problematic.

Table 6. Analysis of Tempo Magazine 26 July-1 August 2021 Issue
 “Abrakadabra Data Corona”

Framing Robert M. Entman	Article Title: “Dusta Angka Corona”
Define Problem	The data on COVID-19 in several regions in Indonesia were allegedly inconsistent. The number of positive cases being treated in the hospital was higher than active cases of COVID-19, and the death rate had not moved for three days. This happened in Surabaya, Malang, Madura, and in North Sumatra.
Diagnose Causes	The local government claimed the anomaly occurred because the regional and central recording systems were different. Several regions did not immediately report to the Ministry of Health so that the area did not enter the black zone and called this method as “delayed data”. Even the Governor of East Java, Khofifah Indar Parawansa, once said that the input of positive case data could be uploaded in several stages so that the graph would not significantly increase.
Make Moral Judgement	A number of local governments were considered to be covering up and playing with COVID-19 data such as weekly positive cases and daily death rates to show that the handling of COVID-19 in the area was fine and so that it did not enter the black zone.
Treatment Recommendation	Coordinating Minister for Maritime Affairs, Luhut Binsar, asked the East Java Forkopimda to report the data as it was and not to be ashamed so that the handling could be optimal because the accuracy of pandemic data is very important in policymaking.

Frustrated by the high number of daily cases in Indonesia, a number of regions were suspected of deliberately playing up the data of daily cases and deaths. Tempo summarized these findings on 26 July – 1 August 2021 issue entitled “Abrakadabra Data Corona”. The term abracadabra used by Tempo as the title of this issue is a term that is often used by magicians in practicing their magic tricks (Mingren, 2019). In this case, Tempo uses figurative language in the form of sarcasm, which is a reference that contains bitter reproach (Keraf, 2007). Tempo criticized the behavior of manipulating COVID-19 data in a number of regions. In fact, in the article entitled “Dusta Angka Corona” Tempo even used the word “lie” to describe the despicable act of this act.

In define problem, Tempo reported Surabaya, Sidoarjo, Malang, Madura, and the province of North Sumatra as the suspected areas of having data manipulation. In Surabaya and Sidoarjo, the number of positive cases treated in hospitals was observed to be higher than active COVID-19 cases. In Malang, the number of death cases did not move for three days. In Madura, there were efforts to hide positive cases by limiting the reporting of positive cases to no more than 100 cases per day. Meanwhile, in North Sumatra, new cases only increased by 284 on 10 July 2021, but 1.521 new cases were recorded on 23 July 2021. WHO recorded an increase in the number of weekly cases in North Sumatra, reaching 238%.

In diagnose cause, Tempo summarized the difference between regional and central recording systems to be the leading cause of data anomaly in East Java and North Sumatra. However, some sources revealed that the Governor of East Java, Khofifah, had said that the input of positive case data could be uploaded in several stages so that the case graph did not immediately rise. According to the three sources, Khofifah delivered this matter when coordinating with East Java Regents and Mayors in Batu, Malang, in

September 2020. As a result, a health official in Madura said that the data on new cases in Bangkalan was not immediately reported to the Ministry of Health. The area did not enter the black zone and called this method as “delayed data”. The data anomaly that occurred in North Sumatra was also most likely due to applying the same method. When Tempo was about to confirm, East Java Governor (Khofifah Indar Parawansa) and North Sumatra Governor (Edy Rahmayadi) did not respond to interviews, confirmations, or clarifications.

In making a moral judgment, Tempo framed the data manipulation in several regions to cover up the positive cases and daily death cases to show good handling of COVID-19 in the area. However, data manipulation can be very dangerous. Minister of Health, Budi Gunadi Sadikin, said it would disrupt the vaccination program, distribution of drugs, medical oxygen, and the allocation of other medical equipment to the regions.

In treatment recommendation, Tempo reported that the discrepancy in the COVID-19 data in the regions was also questioned by the Coordinating Minister for Maritime Affairs and the Coordinator of the Java-Bali Emergency PPKM, Luhut Binsar Pandjaitan. Luhut also asked the Head of Forkopimda (Communication Forum for Regional Leaders) East Java to report the data. In the virtual meeting regarding isolation facilities and social assistance on 9 July 2021, Luhut said “There is no need to be ashamed so that we can improve together”. The head of the Eijkman Institute for Molecular Biology, Amin Soebandrio, said that this data manipulation could have a domino effect because the pandemic is considered under control, but it is not. As a result, public awareness becomes loose, activities in public spaces increase so that it has the potential to trigger new positive cases.

Watchdog Journalism

Based on the analysis of five articles from five different issues, it can be seen that Tempo coherently and cohesively frames the government’s response and policies in dealing with the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia. The most prominent issues from the five articles above are (1) the government is insensitive and unresponsive to the current state of COVID-19 (articles 1, 3); (2) the government is inconsistent in implementing PPKM (articles 1, 3); (3) the government is too focused on economic recovery (articles 2, 3, 4); and (4) the coordination within government bodies is chaotic (articles 2, 3, 4, 5). As a whole, Tempo, in its news framing, seems consistent in presenting facts on the ground as well as providing criticism of the government’s responses and policies.

The criticisms framed by Tempo can be classified as a manifestation of the press function, namely watchdog journalism. This function is a democracy strengthening mechanism that acts as The Fourth Estate, or the fourth pillar of power of a country after the executive, legislative, and judiciary in balancing power through criticism (bad conditions) and control (political, business, and community) (Hanitzsch, 2005; Vaca-Baqueiro, 2018). Although watchdog journalism is a concept born from the Libertarian Media Theory of Press, while Indonesia is not a country that adheres to the press concept, the actual concept of watchdog journalism is implemented by the Indonesian press in Law No. 40 of 1999 concerning the Press in Article 3 (1) which reads, the national press has a function as a medium of information, education, entertainment, and social control.

Watchdog journalism is divided into two sub-dimensions, namely detached watchdog—leaning towards the passive voice of journalists when observing power by

presenting reality—and interventionist watchdog—shaping reality within the framework of journalists, by openly questioning, criticizing, and making accusations while observing power (Márquez-Ramírez et al., 2020). In this case, Tempo applies an interventionist watchdog because it presents facts on the ground in framing the news as well as provides criticism to the government’s responses and policies, both in actual data as well as interviews or confirmation to the responsible parties and through diction, rhetorical meaning, news schemes, issue highlights, and discourse.

There are at least three operational dimensions in watchdog journalism. The first dimension is the intensity of scrutiny, which contains the level of reporting by questioning and interrogating, the level of open criticism to the level of confrontation or questioning “aggressively”, and even expressing anger or voicing accusations in an aggressive manner with comprehensive proof of wrongdoing. The second dimension is the journalistic voice which contains supervision or testimony based on sources or third parties. Even in interventionist watchdog, journalists can express their opinions. This dimension can be achieved through the testimony of sources or the voice of journalists to question, criticize, or openly accuse. The third is the source of the news event, where journalists actively seek and uncover cases in an investigative manner, not just citing reports, press releases, or judicial decisions (Márquez-Ramírez et al., 2020).

Tempo implements three dimensions of watchdog journalism in each of its articles. One article entitled “Serangan Kedua dari Delta” will illustrate it more comprehensively. In the first dimension, the intensity of scrutiny, Tempo questioned whether the Delta variant caused the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia. Tempo also interviewed the pulmonologist at Persahabatan Hospital, Erlina Burhan, and the Chair of the Institute of Tropical Disease, Universitas Airlangga, Maria Lucia Inge Lusida. According to Erlina, the Delta variant spreads 60-70% faster than the non-variant from Wuhan, China. Maria confirmed the allegation that the Delta variant caused the second wave of COVID-19. She mentioned a study at the WHO on the topic. Maria claimed, “The Delta variant makes the severity of the disease even greater.” Tempo also openly criticized the Ministry of Transportation did not immediately close access to international flights to and from India. This criticism is evidenced by a statement to the press by the Minister of Transportation Budi Karya Sumadi, who said, “We still need logistics such as oxygen and vaccines.”

In the second dimension, the journalistic voice, Tempo asked for testimony from sources in the framework of open criticism and accusations to the government regarding the government’s inconsistency in implementing PPKM and the poor implementation of tracking, tracing, and testing (3T). Regarding PPKM, Tempo interviewed Erlina Burhan, as the spokesperson for the IDI COVID-19 Task Force, who admitted that she was surprised by the government’s policy to quarantine international travelers for only 5x14 days. Erlina said she doubted that the coronavirus could be detected in just five days. She stated, “The quarantine should be carried out for 14 days according to the incubation period of the virus in the WHO guidelines.” As for 3T, Tempo interviewed the Head of the Eijkman Institute for Molecular Biology, Amin Soebandrio. He said, “Not all laboratories in Indonesia can do this research... apart from the inadequate capacity of research tools, there are limited reagents and human resources.” In addition to using the voices of sources, Tempo also uses the voices of journalists as a form of expression and criticism regarding 3T, “Sloppy upstream will mess the downstream.”

The third dimension is the source of the news event. Tempo plays an active role in the direct investigation of the actual phenomena experienced by the community. Tempo

interviewed Ridwan Fauzi, a resident of Cibinong who had difficulty finding an empty hospital for his uncle. He had contacted four hospitals in the Bogor area, but they all refused because they were full. Ridwan also said, "I decided to do self-isolation at home." Doctors in several hospitals also complained that apart from running out of isolation rooms, they also ran out of oxygen supply. For example, Nur Hidayah Hospital, Bantul admitted that they were frantically looking for oxygen supplies to areas in Central Java and had to postpone surgery for COVID-19 patients because they ran out of oxygen. Burial officials were also overwhelmed. Nuryasin, a COVID-19 relocation officer in Jakarta, admitted that his workload had doubled in the last two weeks. The Head of the Whole Genome Sequencing Research Team at Universitas Gadjah Mada, Gunadi, complained that the limited research tools and the high cost of whole-genome sequencing research made 3T's efforts not optimal. This immediate investigation conducted by Tempo aims to find out data and real phenomena in the field and avoid manipulation that is deliberately not highlighted by the government.

Conclusion

Based on the analysis using Robert M. Entman's framing model in this study, the researchers found the most highlighted issues in Tempo. First of all, the government was insensitive and irresponsible to the current condition of COVID-19. Then, the government was inconsistent in implementing PPKM. The government was also too focused on economic recovery, even planning to do business for COVID-19 therapeutic drugs and vaccinations. Lastly, there has been coordination chaos within the government body.

Tempo, through its news framing, also carried out the function of the press as social control, in accordance with the mandate of Law No. 40 of 1999 about Press in Article 3 (1). Contextually, this function manifests the watchdog journalism concept which is implemented in three dimensions. The first dimension is the intensity of scrutiny. Tempo voiced accusations of the second wave of COVID-19 in Indonesia by presenting evidence of errors (not immediately close international borders, especially from and to India). The second dimension is the journalistic voice. Tempo uses the testimonies of relevant sources and Tempo journalists themselves in the critical framework and open accusations to the government regarding the government's inconsistency in implementing PPKM and the poor implementation of 3T. The third dimension is the source of the news event. Tempo plays an active role by directly investigating the actual phenomena experienced by the community, health workers, burial and relocation officials for COVID-19 bodies, and researchers.

To confirm the concept of watchdog journalism as a function of social control of the press running optimally in Indonesia, the researchers suggest further research that discusses the implementation of watchdog journalism in other mass media such as newspapers, radio, television, or online media. Both textual analysis and in-depth interviews within the framework of phenomenological analysis or case studies are suggested to grow research in journalism.

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank scholarship, funders, enumerators, etc.

References

- Almuttaqi, A. I. (2020). Kekacauan Respons terhadap COVID-19 di Indonesia. *The Habibie Center Insights*, 1(13), 1–7. <http://habibiecenter.or.id/img/publication/66f28c42de71fefe1c6fcdee37a5c1a6.pdf>
- Bloomberg. (2021). *The Covid Resilience Ranking The Best And Worst Places to Be as Reopening, Variants Collide*. <https://www.bloomberg.com/graphics/covid-resilience-ranking/>
- Denzin, N.K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2018). *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research 5th Edition*. California: SAGE Publications, INC.
- Eriyanto. (2018). *Media dan Opini Publik*. Depok: PT Rajagrafindo Persada.
- Hanitzsch, T. (2005). Journalists in Indonesia: Educated but timid watchdogs. *Journalism Studies*, 6(4), 493–508. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616700500250396>
- Hidayat, A., Ilahi, A., & Widowaty, Y. (2021). The Optimization of Corruption Deterrence during the Covid-19 Pandemic. *Padjajaran Journal of Law*, 8(1), 71–91.
- Keraf, G. (2007). *Diksi dan Gaya Bahasa*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Kerekes, S. (2021). Analyzing Lockdown Policies and Their Effectiveness in *Challenges*, 12(20), 1–8. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.3390/challe12020020>
- Khoerunisa, N., & Noorikhsan, F. F. (2021). Perbandingan Tata Kelola Penanganan Pandemi Covid 19 di Indonesia dan India. *Journal of Political Issues*, 2(2), 89–101. <https://doi.org/10.33019/jpi.v2i2.36>
- Ma'arief Alyatalathaf, M. D. (2018). Spasialisasi dan Praktik Monopoli Emtek Group. *Jurnal ASPIKOM*, 3(5), 903. <https://doi.org/10.24329/aspikom.v3i5.337>
- Marina, H. (2021). Inkonsistensi Kebijakan Pemerintah Pusat dalam Penanganan Covid-19 Di Indonesia. *KEMUDI: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 5(02), 215–238. <https://doi.org/10.31629/kemudi.v5i02.2853>
- Márquez-Ramírez, M., Mellado, C., Humanes, M. L., Amado, A., Beck, D., Davydov, S., Mick, J., Mothes, C., Olivera, D., Panagiotu, N., Roses, S., Silke, H., Sparks, C., Stepińska, A., Szabó, G., Tandoc, E., & Wang, H. (2020). Detached or Interventionist? Comparing the Performance of Watchdog Journalism in Transitional, Advanced and Non-democratic Countries. *International Journal of Press/Politics*, 25(1), 53–75. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1940161219872155>
- Mata Najwa. (2020). Jokowi Diuji Pandemi: Didesak Mundur, Menkes Terawan Dipuji Jokowi (Part 1) | Mata Najwa. In *Mata Najwa*. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JFHHzLixfXA&t=564s&ab_channel=NajwaShihab
- Mellone, A., Gong, Z., & Scarciotti, G. (2021). Modelling, prediction and design of COVID-19 lockdowns by stringency and duration. *Scientific Reports*, 11(1), 15708. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-021-95163-8>
- Mingren, W. (2019). *Say the Magic Word: The Origins of Abracadabra*. <https://www.ancient-origins.net/history-ancient-traditions/say-magic-word-origins-abracadabra-and-other-magical-mutterings-008076>
- Nature.com. (2021). *Delta threatens rural regions that dodged earlier COVID waves*. <https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-021-02146-w>
- Salvetat, M. L., Salati, C., Busatto, P., & Zeppieri, M. (2021). *related national lockdown in Italy: A multicenter study*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/11206721211028046>
- Şen, A. F. (2021). Watchdog Journalism during the Coronavirus Crisis in Turkey.

- Advances in Applied Sociology*, 11(10), 500–512.
<https://doi.org/10.4236/aasoci.2021.1110044>
- Sheikh, A., McMenamin, J., Taylor, B., & Robertson, C. (2021). SARS-CoV-2 Delta VOC in Scotland: demographics, risk of hospital admission, and vaccine effectiveness. *The Lancet*, 397(10293), 2461–2462.
[https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(21\)01358-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(21)01358-1)
- Siddique, R. M. S., & Rahman, B. H. (2017). Journal of Media Studies. *Journal of Media Studies*, 32(2), 1–36.
- Sobur, A. (2018). *Analisis Teks Media: Suatu Pengantar untuk Analisis Wacana, Analisis Semiotik, dan Analisis Framing*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Tempo.co. (2021). *Gonta-ganti Istilah Kebijakan Pemerintah Atasi Covid-19, dari PSBB sampai PPKM*. <https://grafis.tempo.co/read/2747/gonta-ganti-istilah-kebijakan-pemerintah-atasi-covid-19-dari-psbb-sampai-ppkm>
- Tempo. (2021). *Lobi-lobi dan Persaingan Bisnis Mengegolkan Ivermectin Sebagai Obat Covid* (hal. Laporan Utama, 5-11 Juli 2021).
- Tuwu, D., Laksmono, B. S., Huraerah, A., & Harjudin, L. (2021). Dinamika Kebijakan Penanganan Pandemi COVID-19 Dalam Perspektif Kesejahteraan Sosial. *Sosio Konsepsia*, 10(2), 97–110.
<https://ejournal.kemsos.go.id/index.php/SosioKonsepsia/article/view/2158>
- Vaca-Baqueiro, M. T. (2018). *Four Theories of The Press*. New York: Routledge.
- Welley, M. M., Oroh, F. N. S., & Walangitan, M. D. (2021). Perbandingan Harga Saham Perusahaan Farmasi BumN Sebelum Dan Sesudah Pengembangan Vaksin Virus Corona (Covid-19). *JMBI UNSRAT (Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen Bisnis dan Inovasi Universitas Sam Ratulangi)*, 7(3), 571–579.
<https://doi.org/10.35794/jmbi.v7i3.31514>
- WHO. (2020). *Novel-Coronavirus-2019* *Www.Who.Int*.
<https://www.who.int/es/emergencies/diseases/novel-coronavirus-2019>
- Woda, B. E., Birowo, M. A., Vidiadari, I. S., & Nuswantoro, R. (2021). Pandemic Journalism: A Study of Covid-19 News Coverage on detik.com. *Jurnal ASPIKOM*, 6(2), 235. <https://doi.org/10.24329/aspikom.v6i2.906>
- Worldmeter. (2021). *Coronavirus Cases*. <https://www.worldometers.info/coronavirus/>